#### Follow-up Audit Consolidation of Selected Activities of the Parks and Recreation and Public Works Departments

April 2000

**City Auditor's Office** 

City of Kansas City, Missouri

#### April 19, 2000

Honorable Mayor, Members of the City Council, and Members of the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners:

This follow-up audit of the consolidation of duplicative activities in the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments was initiated by the city auditor pursuant to Article II, Section 13 of the city charter. The follow-up report was initiated as part of the City Auditor's Office policy of determining department progress in improving program operations subsequent to issuance of our audit reports.

Our July 1995 performance audit, *Consolidation of Selected Activities, Parks and Recreation and Public Works Departments* found significant duplication in the four areas reviewed (motor equipment efforts, construction, building maintenance, and street-related maintenance). We recommended that the city manager prepare a detailed proposal for consideration by the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners for consolidating activities in these areas.

This follow-up audit focused on determining the efforts made by both departments to evaluate the potential for consolidating activities in the four areas described in the original audit. The staff's efforts did result in increased communication between the departments, improved coordination of similar activities and some consolidation, primarily in street sweeping and building maintenance contracts. In most cases, however, the departments decided to maintain separate operations, citing concerns of differing priorities, different legislative authority, different sources of funding, and a lack of expertise in each other's activities.

Street sweeping operations are now performed exclusively by the Public Works Department, along with other on-call street-related maintenance activities. The departments share contracts for certain non-emergency building and facility maintenance functions. In addition, standardized construction contract guidelines have been developed. While we were unable to identify the impact of these operational changes on service delivery, department staff estimate that more than a half million dollars has been saved from their efforts.

Motor equipment maintenance operations remain separate. Although some Parks and Recreation mechanics were moved to the Public Works Department's Municipal Service Center, they continue to work exclusively on Parks and Recreation Department vehicles, do not utilize the Public Works Department fleet management information system, and do not order parts from the Public Works storeroom.

We recommend the directors of Parks and Recreation and Public Works direct their staffs to consider further consolidation in motor equipment, construction, building maintenance, and street-related maintenance efforts, while participating in the citywide comprehensive service improvements initiative.

Any proposed modifications in activities should be communicated to the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners for deliberation. Also, staff in both departments should continue their efforts to develop and gather performance information for tracking the efficiency and effectiveness of their activities over time.

The draft follow-up report was sent to the city manager, and the directors of the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments on March 24, 2000. Written responses are included as appendices. We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation extended to us during this project by staff in the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments. The audit team for this project included Anatoli Douditski and Gary White.

Mark Funkhouser City Auditor

# Follow-Up Audit: Consolidation of Selected Activities of the Parks and Recreation and Public Works Departments

7D 11	0.01	4		

#### **Table of Contents**

Introduction	1
Purpose and Authority	1
Scope and Methodology	1
Background	2
Legislative Authority	2
Funding Sources and Department Expenditures	3
Summary of the 1995 Audit	4
Findings and Recommendations	5
Summary	5
Department Efforts Primarily Increased Communication and Coordination	6
Task Forces Identified Opportunites for Improvement	6
Street Sweeping and Some Building Maintenance Contracts Were Consolidated	7
Coordination Has Increased	8
Efforts Have Resulted in City Savings	9
Opportunities For Further Improvements Through Consolidation Remain	10
Reported Motor Equipment Consolidation Efforts Were Subsequently Discontinued	10
Some Performance Information Exists	13
Consolidation Concerns Can Be Successfully Addressed	13
Further Consolidation Opportunities Exist	14
Recommendations	16
Appendix A: Prior Audit Recommendation	17
Appendix B: Audit Report Tracking System (ARTS) Reports	21
Appendix C: Consolidation Status of Selected Parks and Public Works Department Activities	53
Appendix D: Director of Parks and Recreation's Response	57
Appendix E: Director of Public Works' Response	61
List of Exhibits	
Exhibit 1. Parks and Recreation Expenditures, Fiscal Year 1999	3
Exhibit 2. Public Works Expenditures, Fiscal Year 1999	4
Exhibit 3. Reported Savings from Department Efforts	9
Exhibit 4. Comparison of Vehicle Maintenance Activities, 1995 and 2000	12

#### Introduction

#### **Purpose and Authority**

This follow-up audit of consolidation of selected activities of the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments was conducted pursuant to Article II, Section 13 of the Charter of Kansas City, Missouri, which establishes the Office of the City Auditor and outlines the city auditor's primary duties.

A performance audit is an objective, systematic examination of evidence to independently assess the performance of a government organization, program, activity, or function in order to provide information to improve public accountability and facilitate decision-making. A follow-up audit is an examination to determine whether timely and appropriate corrective actions have been taken by auditee officials.<sup>1</sup>

This follow-up audit was designed to answer the following questions:

- What efforts were expended by city staff to evaluate the potential for consolidation of building maintenance, construction, street-related maintenance, and motor equipment activities?
- Have consolidation/coordination efforts achieved any improvements in performance and service delivery?

#### **Scope and Methodology**

This follow-up audit was not intended to be another full-scale audit of consolidation opportunities available to the two departments. Rather, it was designed to determine the progress made by the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments in achieving monetary savings and improvements in performance and service delivery through consolidation of their similar activities. The follow-up audit was performed in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards, with the exception of the completion of an external quality

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Comptroller General of the United States, *Government Auditing Standards* (Washington, DC: U. S. Government Printing Office, 1994), pp. 14 and 68.

control review of the office within the last three years.<sup>2</sup> Audit methods included:

- Reviewing prior audit work and subsequent Audit Report Tracking System (ARTS) reports.
- Reviewing records in the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments.
- Interviewing staff in the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments.
- Reviewing the city's annual budgets.

No information was omitted from this report because it was deemed privileged or confidential.

#### **Background**

#### **Legislative Authority**

The two departments included in the audit are not under the same supervision. The Public Works Department is under the supervision of the city manager, while the Parks and Recreation Department is supervised by the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners.

The city charter assigns responsibility to the director of public works for:

- Public buildings and facilities not under control of any other department.
- Streets and public places, specifically those not under control of the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners.
- Pavements, curbs and sidewalks, not under control of the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners.<sup>3</sup>

The Code of Ordinances also assigns the director of public works responsibility for the purchase, storage, repair, servicing, assignment, and accounting of all motor equipment assigned to the public works

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The last review was in April 1995. An external review is planned for the current year.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Charter of Kansas City, Missouri, Article III, Section 29.

working capital fund, along with necessary garage facilities for these purposes.<sup>4</sup>

The city charter assigns responsibility for the Parks and Recreation Department to the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners. The charter establishes the board's responsibility for managing any and all parks, parkways, boulevards, and highways. The City Council is given the power, upon the board's recommendation, to pass ordinances for the regulation and orderly government of these areas. The charter does not prohibit the consolidation of the activities under review, provided the board recommends consolidation to the City Council.

#### **Funding Sources and Department Expenditures**

Similar activities performed by Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments are funded from different sources. Parks and Recreation Department activities are primarily funded from East Park and West Park funds with a smaller portion coming from the city's general fund. Funding for the activities performed by Public Works comes from the general fund and from Motor Fuel Tax Fund.

Parks and Recreation Department operating expenditures for fiscal year 1999 were about \$33 million. (See Exhibit 1.) Public Works operating expenditures for fiscal year 1999 were about \$31 million. (See Exhibit 2.)

Exhibit 1. Parks and Recreation Expenditures, Fiscal Year 1999 Zoo \$7,877,819 Park Maintenance Services 6,726,603 **Community Centers** 3,271,001 Golf Course and Tennis Center Operations 2,868,885 **Recreation Programs** 2,495,688 Forestry and Landscaping Services 2,194,502 **Boulevards and Parkways** 2,186,656 **Property and Equipment Maintenance** 2,014,923 Administration 1,512,467 Cultural and Heritage Programs 1,151,893 Park Planning and Design Services 899,428 Total \$33,199,865

Source: Submitted Budget 2001.

1

Code of Ordinances, Kansas City, Missouri, Section 2-462.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Charter of Kansas City, Missouri, Article III, Section 55.

Exhibit 2. Public Works Expenditures,	Fiscal Year 1999
Street and Traffic Operations	\$15,838,581
Public Building Maintenance	5,181,234
Street Lighting	3,060,303
Engineering Services	2,788,486
Motor Equipment Operations	2,365,730
Administration	1,557,429
Total	\$30,791,763

Source: Submitted Budget 2001.

#### **Summary of the 1995 Audit**

Our original audit found duplication of effort in motor equipment, construction, building maintenance, and street-related maintenance performed by the two departments.

Motor equipment efforts were found to be comparable except for some of the types of equipment maintained. Construction efforts were similar except that the Public Works Department projects were larger in scope and size. Building maintenance and street-related maintenance (mowing along streets and street sweeping) were parallel operations with each department responsible for different city-owned properties or different city streets.

The audit report concluded that there was a potential for significant savings from consolidating these activities. The report pointed out that consolidation would provide both departments with opportunities to improve managerial effectiveness and would permit management to more easily identify areas where improvements could be implemented over the entire workload more quickly.

The audit recommended that the city manager prepare a proposal for consideration by the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners for consolidation of the four operations. As part of the proposal, we recommended the city manager determine whether each activity should be modified to enhance coordination between the departments, partially consolidated, or fully consolidated in a single department. We also recommended that the city manager develop a timetable for implementing changes to each activity. (See Appendix A.) Audit Report Tracking System (ARTS) Reports submitted by management are included in Appendix B.

#### **Findings and Recommendations**

#### **Summary**

In response to our 1995 audit, the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments examined more than 40 activities related to construction, motor equipment, street-related and building maintenance activities. Results included some consolidation, and increased communication and coordination between the departments. While we were unable to identify the impact of these operational changes on service delivery, department staff estimate that these efforts have resulted in monetary savings of more than half a million dollars.

Progress has been made in consolidating street and boulevard-related maintenance. Public Works undertook all regular and on-call boulevard and parkway sweeping, and assumed responsibility for other on-call maintenance activities. The departments share contracts for some building maintenance functions and standardized construction contract guidelines have been developed.

Motor Equipment maintenance operations, however, remain separate. Although some Parks and Recreation mechanics were moved to the Public Works Department's Municipal Service Center, they continue to work exclusively on Parks and Recreation Department vehicles, do not utilize the Public Works' fleet management information system, and do not order parts from the Public Works storeroom.

Department staff should consider further consolidation while participating in the city's recent initiative to improve city performance by examining efficiency, effectiveness, and economy in city service delivery. Any proposed modifications in activities should be communicated to the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners for deliberation. In addition, staff in both departments should continue their efforts to develop and gather performance information that would enable tracking the efficiency and effectiveness of their activities over time.

#### **Department Efforts Primarily Increased Communication and Coordination**

Efforts by both departments to address the 1995 audit resulted in increased communication between the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments, better coordination of the activities perceived by the departments as similar, and some consolidation. Street sweeping and some building maintenance contracts were consolidated. Coordination increased in construction, and city staff sought to establish city-wide construction contract guidelines. Department staff estimate that their efforts have resulted in more than a half million dollars in actual savings.

#### **Glossary of Terms**

**Communication -** The imparting or interchange of thoughts, opinions, or information by speech, writing, or signs.

**Coordination -** Harmonious combination or interaction, as of functions or parts.

**Cooperation -** An act or instance of working or acting together for a common purpose or benefit; joint action.

**Consolidation – (**from **Consolidate)** - Bring together separate parts into a single or unified whole; unite; combine; make solid or firm; strengthen.

Source: Random House Webster's Unabridged Dictionary, 1999.

#### **Task Forces Identified Opportunities for Improvement**

In response to our audit, task forces that included staff from both departments were created and asked to identify opportunities for improving service delivery through improved communication, cooperation, or consolidation. Four task forces were established:

- Street/Boulevard Related Maintenance
- Building/Facility Maintenance
- Construction Projects and Inspections
- Motorized Equipment

Each task force issued status reports on consolidation goals, achievements, and any resulting monetary savings. These reports were presented to the City Council and the city auditor as part of the ARTS reports submitted in November 1996, May 1997, November 1997, and May 1998. (See Appendix B for copies of the ARTS reports.) The ARTS reports and subsequent interviews with senior staff from both

departments indicate that, with some exceptions, the task forces decided against full consolidation of their assigned activities.

## **Street Sweeping and Some Building Maintenance Contracts Were Consolidated**

The most progress toward consolidation made since the release of our 1995 audit was in street- and boulevard-related maintenance. Some building maintenance contracts were also consolidated and efforts to consolidate city mowing continue.

**Public Works now performs all street sweeping.** The biggest single activity reported as consolidated after the 1995 audit was street and boulevard sweeping. Prior to our original audit, Parks and Recreation contracted with crews from the private sector for sweeping boulevards and parkways. Starting in fiscal year 1999, Parks and Recreation contracted with the Public Works Department for scheduled sweeping. In fiscal year 2000, Public Works also took over the Parks and Recreation Department's on-call sweeping.

Consolidation of street/boulevard sweeping resulted in service improvements. Consolidation helped Public Works to fund the current street sweeping program. The frequency of sweeping on residential streets has increased from two to seven times a year and gaps in routes, where a sweeper had to stop at the beginning of a boulevard because these streets had to be swept by Parks and Recreation crews or their contractors have been eliminated. The switch from private contractors to Public Works crews also allowed the city to increase the frequency of sweeping cycles on boulevards from 16 to 18 times a year.<sup>6</sup>

Some building and facility non-emergency maintenance contracts have been consolidated. Public Works is responsible for overseeing all building maintenance contracts that do not require fast emergency service. Originally, all contracts for plumbing emergencies were also consolidated in Public Works. However, Parks and Recreation Department staff was unsatisfied with response times for plumbing emergencies. As a result, Parks and Recreation now maintains a separate contract for plumbing.

**Street mowing contract consolidation is still being studied.** The Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments have also studied the possibility of consolidating mowing efforts. Staff reports that since 1987, Parks and Recreation contracted its mowing of park properties.

7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Parks and Recreation staff report that the frequency of boulevard sweeping will be reduced to 12 during fiscal year 2001.

Public Works also contracted mowing of its properties but found it difficult to find qualified bidders. Staff in both departments recognized the potential for consolidation and determined that Parks and Recreation could complete the contracting process for both departments. However, they also realize that because of differences in the mowing services required, Parks and Recreation staff would first need to become familiar with Public Works mowing needs.

Parks and Recreation Department staff have sought to define service levels for the different types of Public Works mowing operations (side of road, medians, islands, vacant lots). Both departments report that more work is needed before mowing contracts can be consolidated. Parks and Recreation staff feel that consolidation of this activity offers many benefits, including greater utilization of existing staff expertise, and increased consistency and efficiency in mowing contracts.

#### **Coordination Has Increased**

Since our original audit, several activities continue to be performed by both departments, however, reportedly with increased levels of coordination. In addition, efforts were undertaken to standardize contracting practices.

Construction coordination increased. Parks and Recreation and Public Works department staff reported that several meetings of the construction task force occurred since the audit was released. Task force members discussed what activities were performed by both departments, what activities are duplicated and what should be consolidated. In the area of construction design, the task force concluded that the workloads in both departments are unique, requiring specific expertise. They rejected the idea of consolidating construction activities but agreed to cooperate in masterplan development, selection of consultants, environmental projects, landscaping, and materials testing.

Committees consisting of representatives of various departments were also formed to revise contracting practices in construction. As a result of work of these committees, a set of guidelines for construction contracts was developed. According to staff in Public Works, this should allow the city to interchange contract administrators between various departments in peak loads. Also, this will allow borrowing staff from other departments to do inspections because everyone will be trained on the same set of standards. Work on the guidelines continues.

**Coordination in other areas also increased.** Other areas that have been coordinated include the placement of emergency safety barriers and other

emergency responses. Finally, Public Works and Parks and Recreation share facilities in several locations.

#### **Efforts Have Resulted in City Savings**

The November 1997 ARTS report for the original audit estimated savings from both departments' efforts to address the report's recommendations at nearly \$625,000. The savings reported were primarily derived from sharing existing facilities instead of constructing new ones and savings derived from motor equipment efforts. The May 1998 ARTS report identified savings of just over \$500,000. This estimate was based on some of the same items included in the previous ARTS report, along with additional savings from combining some maintenance contracts. Savings previously reported for vehicle maintenance efforts were excluded.

**Recent savings estimates exceed half a million dollars.** To assist us in completing this follow-up, department staff were enlisted to identify savings from their efforts. Department staff estimate that these efforts have resulted in monetary savings of more than half a million dollars. (See Exhibit 3.)

Exhibit 3. Reported Savings from Department Efforts

Savings Source	Savings
Shared office space at PACCR	\$301,250
Consolidation of annual building maintenance contracts	109,485
Shared garage space at the Municipal Service Center	96,000
Street sweeping consolidation <sup>7</sup>	53,832
Shared office space at 4600 E. 63 <sup>rd</sup> Street	2,600
Total	\$563,167

Sources: Parks and Recreation and Public Works department staff.

Savings reported include overall cost reductions in street sweeping efforts and reduced administrative costs for building maintenance contracts. In addition, the two departments report significant savings from cost avoidance through sharing facilities.

**Departments share some facilities.** The Public Works Street Lights Division and Parks and Recreation Department decided to mutually use the PACCR building located at 1302 Chouteau Trafficway instead of leasing separate office space. Based on the current market rate, the savings from avoiding lease payments amount to \$120,500 annually. Also, Public Works Engineering Division occupies office space at a Parks' facility at 4600 East 63<sup>rd</sup> Street in exchange for making

9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Parks and Recreation staff report the recent reduction in street sweeping frequency during fiscal year 2001 will impact on future savings figures.

improvements to the building and the parking lot. In this instance, the city saves \$10,400 annually it would have otherwise spent on lease payments. Finally, several Parks and Recreation vehicle maintenance mechanics relocated to the Public Works Department's Municipal Service Center (MSC). Instead of building a four-bay garage at a price of \$350,000, the Parks and Recreation Department uses four bays at MSC, spending \$30,000 on facility improvements. In this case, annual savings to the city are estimated at \$32,000.

Staff reports the city may be saving approximately \$226,000 annually as a result of their efforts. Many of the identified savings are expected to continue for several years to come.

#### **Opportunities For Further Improvements Through Consolidation Remain**

Despite the departments' efforts, many activities continue to be performed separately, most notably motor equipment operations. The original audit concluded that potential savings could be derived from consolidation and that the benefits outweighed the concerns expressed by department staff. We still believe consolidation should be pursued.

Department staff should consider further consolidation while participating the city's recent comprehensive services improvement initiative. Any proposed modifications in motor equipment, construction, building maintenance, and street-related maintenance should be communicated to the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners for deliberation. In addition, staff in both departments should continue their efforts to develop and gather performance information that would allow both departments to monitor and document the efficiency and effectiveness of their activities over time.

## **Reported Motor Equipment Consolidation Efforts Were Subsequently Discontinued**

The original audit found that motor equipment operations in the two departments were virtually the same, except for some differences in the type of equipment maintained. Positions in Parks and Recreation were duplicated in Public Works. A consultant hired by Parks and Recreation to review its motor equipment operations found it lacking in personnel, facilities, and information systems and recommended significant

Findings and Recommendations

investment to address these deficiencies.<sup>8</sup> Consolidation was expected to make this investment unnecessary.

Our follow-up found that efforts to consolidate motorized equipment maintenance were not completed. Motor vehicle maintenance continues to be performed separately by each department. While six Parks and Recreation mechanics were moved to MSC, another nine continue to repair vehicles at Parks and Recreation district offices. The mechanics at MSC maintain only Parks and Recreation Department vehicles.

Efforts to consolidate were begun. According to the November 1996 ARTS report, moving Parks and Recreation Department mechanics from Parks and Recreation facilities to MSC was intended to allow both staffs to eventually share workloads during busy periods. In addition, Parks and Recreation was to begin to purchase parts from the Public Works storeroom. Finally, Parks and Recreation vehicles were to be added to GEMS 2000, Public Works' fleet management system that, among other things, tracks mechanics' productivity.

Changes were largely abandoned. In our follow-up, we found that the Parks and Recreation mechanics located at MSC continue to work solely on Parks and Recreation vehicles. Parks and Recreation mechanics do not report to Public Works management and discontinued using GEMS 2000, citing a lack of beneficial information being obtained from the system for the time spent entering it, and the fact that not all vehicles are repaired at the MSC location. Parks and Recreation also stopped buying parts from Public Works' storeroom, citing the 25 percent surcharge assessed on their purchases. Parks and Recreation staff report, however, that they continue to utilize the same city-wide contract that Public Works uses in purchasing vehicle parts and other supplies.

As part of our follow-up, we compared the manner in which activities were performed prior to the audit to the manner in which they are performed today, based on the different activities identified by the task forces established to review the potential for consolidation. Motor equipment activities are shown in Exhibit 4.

Ω

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> City of Kansas City, Missouri Parks & Recreation Department, District Four Garage Study (Draft), Bucher, Wills & Ratliff and David M. Griffith and Associates, March 1995, p. II-15.

Exhibit 4. Comparison of Vehicle Maintenance Activities, 1995 and 2000

	Status in	
Activity	1995	Status in 2000
Parts Purchasing	Separate	City-wide contract
Consumables	Separate	City-wide contract
Vehicle Purchasing	Separate	City-wide contracts.
		Specialized vehicles
		purchased separately
Workload Sharing	None	None
Equipment Sharing	None	None
Fueling	Separate	Parks and Public Works
		share a fueling station
Vehicle Specification	Separate	Parks and Public Works
Writing		share specifications
Vehicle Information System	Separate	Separate
Vehicle Warranty	Separate	Separate
Vehicle Road Service	Separate	Separate
Vehicle Maintenance	Separate	Separate
Work Areas	Separate	Separate
Customers	Separate	Separate
Parts Administration	Separate	Separate
Parts Distribution	Separate	Separate
Administration	Separate	Separate

Sources: Interviews with Parks and Recreation and Public Works department staff.

In fiscal year 2000, Parks and Recreation still employed 15 mechanics<sup>9</sup> and spent \$735,000 for vehicle maintenance. Department staff estimate these costs will continue to increase by 8 to 12 percent as the vehicle fleet continues to age without sufficient capital for replacement. With a few exceptions, the departments continue to complete motor equipment operations separately. (See Appendix C for a complete list of the consolidation status of similar department activities.)

Consolidation of motor equipment was recommended by an outside consultant<sup>10</sup> in 1982, and by a task force of city staff in 1992. Both recommended a single motor equipment operation for all city vehicles, including those maintained by Public Works, Parks and Recreation, Aviation, and Water Services. While determining the feasibility of a city-wide motor equipment operation is outside the scope of this follow-up, we continue to believe it would be beneficial to consolidate the

12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Six of these mechanics work at MSC. The other nine repair department vehicles in facilities located at Parks and Recreation district offices.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Motor Vehicle Fleet Study – Detailed Findings and Recommendations, Touche Ross and Co., Kansas City, Missouri, December 15, 1982, p. 138.

vehicle maintenance operations of the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments.

#### **Some Performance Information Exists**

The original audit recommended consolidation be pursued not only to derive monetary savings but also to improve managerial effectiveness. We found limited performance information during the original audit and felt consolidation would provide opportunities for the combined administrative staff to establish and generate outcome measurements.

During the follow-up, we found some performance information is being collected, however, the information has not been gathered long enough to be useful in evaluating the impact of operational changes on service delivery. As a result, we were unable to use performance information to identify any improvements in service delivery or performance resulting from the consolidation efforts of the two departments.

In order to assess the quality and results of their efforts, we recommend management of both departments continue their efforts to develop and gather performance information that would allow the departments to evaluate the efficiency and effectiveness of their activities over time. The information obtained should allow better management of department activities and could assist in evaluating the success of future consolidation efforts. More importantly, this information will help departments effectively monitor the quality and results of their service delivery efforts.

#### Consolidation Concerns Can Be Successfully Addressed

During the original audit, department staff expressed concerns regarding the loss of control consolidation would bring and the lack of expertise one department would have when assuming responsibility for another department's workload. Similar concerns were expressed during the follow-up, along with difficulties resulting from the departments being accountable to different authorities and their activities provided by different funding sources. We do not consider these concerns insurmountable.

#### Customer responsiveness could address control concerns.

Department staff expressed concern about losing control if another department assumed their activities. Similar concerns were expressed during the original audit. One method of addressing this concern is the establishment of a "provider/customer" relationship, wherein one of the goals of the department providing the service is to satisfy the "customer," which in this case is the other department. Some of the established

performance measures previously recommended could be specifically designed to measure the level of satisfaction the other department has with the services they provided prior to consolidation. The needs of the other department should be addressed systematically, comprehensively, and equitably.

#### Consolidation is possible despite differing legislative authority.

Another concern expressed during the follow-up by representatives of both departments is the different legislative authorities under which the departments operate. While both departments operate under different authorities, there is a provision that allows for cooperation between operating authorities. The city charter provides the City Council with the power to pass ordinances for operating activities directed by the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners provided the board recommends such action.

**Differences in funding sources can be negotiated.** As previously mentioned the individual departments are funded from different sources, raising concerns about equity. We anticipate this concern could be addressed through negotiation. Just as city staff reached agreement on compensation when one department began sharing space of the other, issues regarding differences in funding sources could be addressed through negotiation.

Consolidation utilizes staff expertise more effectively. Another concern raised by department staff during both the original audit and the follow-up involved the loss of expertise resulting from consolidation. We do not see consolidation as one staff assuming the workload of another, but rather applying staff expertise over the entire workload of both departments. In the original audit we described the process in three steps. First, the administrative functions would be combined under a single authority or department. Second the operations staff would be combined in a single department. Third, the optimal staffing levels are determined, a function that should be part of the ongoing activities of any operating department. This process combines the expertise of both department staffs to provide the best service delivery possible.

#### **Further Consolidation Opportunities Exist**

Consolidation opportunities could be re-examined as part of the city's comprehensive service improvements initiative. Recently, the city signed a contract with Henningson, Durham and Richardson Architecture and Engineering (HDR). HDR is supposed to help the city develop goals and an approach for improving effectiveness, efficiency, and economy of service delivery. One of the goals is to improve the competitiveness of

Findings and Recommendations

city departments. Public-private partnership is only one of many tools that can be used to improve performance. Consolidation and right-sizing are other tools that could be used.

One step in the process of improving city performance is competitive business planning. City departments will have to develop specific plans and do benchmark studies. When developing their business plans, departments will have an opportunity to re-think or reengineer the way they deliver services. Departments will also have an opportunity to analyze what they do, why and how they do it, and whether they need to do it. While doing so, departments should also re-examine the potential for further consolidation of motor equipment, construction, building maintenance, and street-related maintenance. The city manager reports he has already directed Public Works to address consolidation while participating in this effort.

We continue to believe that additional benefits are possible through consolidation of motor equipment, construction, building maintenance, and street-related maintenance. We recommend the directors of Parks and Recreation and Public Works direct their staff to consider opportunities for further consolidation while participating in the service improvements initiative. Any proposed modifications in motor equipment, construction, building maintenance, and street-related maintenance activities should be communicated to the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners for deliberation.

#### **Recommendations**

- The directors of Parks and Recreation and Public Works should direct staff to consider opportunities for further consolidation in motor equipment, construction, building maintenance, and streetrelated maintenance while participating in the city's comprehensive initiatives and efficiencies effort.
- 2. The directors of Parks and Recreation and Public Works should direct staff to prepare a report to the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners describing any proposed modifications in motor equipment, construction, building maintenance, and street-related maintenance efforts identified while participating in the city's comprehensive initiatives and efficiencies effort.
- 3. The directors of Parks and Recreation and Public Works should present the report of proposed modifications in motor equipment, construction, building maintenance and street-related maintenance to both the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners for deliberation.
- 4. The directors of Parks and Recreation and Public Works should continue their efforts to develop and gather performance information that would allow the departments to monitor and document the efficiency and effectiveness of their activities over time.

# Appendix A

Follow-Up Audit: Consolidation of Selected Activities of the Parks and Recreation and Public Works Departments

#### **Prior Audit Recommendation**

1. We recommend that the city manager prepare a detailed proposal for consideration by the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners for consolidating motor equipment, construction, building maintenance, and street-related maintenance operations. For each activity, the proposal should include a determination of whether the city should modify the current system to enhance coordination between the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments, fully consolidate the activity in a single department, or partially consolidate the activity. The proposal should include a timetable for implementation for each activity.

Follow-Up Audit: Consolidation of Selected Activities of the Parks and Recreation and Public Works Departments

### Appendix B

**Audit Report Tracking System (ARTS) Reports** 

Follow-Up Audit: Consolidation of Selected Activities of the Parks and Recreation and Public Works Departments

	Audit Report	t Tracking System	
1. Audit Title	-	2.  This Report Date	
CONSOLIDATION OF SELEC	TED ACTIVITIES	29-Nov-95	
3. Department		4. Last Report Date	
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTME	NT	NONE	
5. Department Head		6. Contact Person/Phone	
GEORGE E. WOLF, JR.		LARRY FREVERT/274-1778	
7. Audit Release Date		8. ARTS Number	
31-Jul-95			
9. Status of All Audit Recommend		Status	Date
Status	Date	Status	Date
1. PARTIALLY IMPLEMENTED	11/29/96		
	-		

#### 10. Recommendations Included in this Report

Recommendation No. 1: We recommend that the City Manager prepare a detailed proposal for consideration by the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners for consolidating motor equipment, construction, building maintenance and street-related maintenance operations. For each activity, the proposal should include a determination of whether the City should modify the current system to enhance coordination between the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments, fully consolidate the activity in a single department, or partially consolidate the activity. The proposal should also include a timetable for implementation for each activity.

Status: The transformation of city government initiative of the city manager is beginning to address this recommendation. The Public Works Department and the Parks and Recreation Department, along with the Water Services Department comprise the Infrastructure Investment Group and as such are seeking methods of improving customer service, at the least possible cost with the greatest citizen and associate satisfaction. A transition process has begun with the heavy equipment maintenance and repair section of the Parks and Recreation Department relocating from its 17th and Elmwood site to the Public Works' equipment maintenance and repair central site, Municipal Service Center. The two departments have appointed a transition coordination team and construction of appropriate supervisor offices and designation of work stations for Parks and Recreation staff has begun. Initially, the equipment repair crews of the two departments will work independently. However, when one department's staff is overloaded and the other has time available, work sharing will occur with charges made against the appropriate department. Parts will be obtained from a single, well stocked "store" at MSC. The Parks and Recreation fleet is being added to the GEMS 2000 fleet management system maintained by the Public Works Department.

Page 2 of 2 **Audit Report Tracking System** CONSOLIDATION OF SELECTED ACTIVITIES **Audit Title:** 29-Nov-96 Report Date: 10. Recommendations Included in this Report (continued) Recommendation No. 1 (Continued): In time, opportunities will be pursued as appropriate for further consolidation of efforts and work sharing. At this point, consolidation efforts in the areas of construction, building maintenance, and street-related maintenance have not occurred. Until a policy decision is made that re-structures city government, the Public Works Department (currently accountable through the city manager to the City Council) and the Parks and Recreation Department (currently accountable through the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners) will have differing priorities and objectives which hinder implementation of this recommendation. The staffs of the Public Works Department and the Parks and Recreation Department do meet at least monthly to discuss projects of mutual concern and to insure that work is coordinated and similiar work objectives are being followed.

	Audit Report	Tracking System
<u> </u>	Audit Title Consolidation of Selected Activities	2. This Report Date November 29, 1996
3.	Department Parks and Recreation Department	4. Last Report Date None
	Department Head Terry R. Dopson	6. Contact Person/Phone Mark L. McHenry/871-5781
7,	Audit Release Date July 31, 1995	8. ARTS Number
9.	Status of All Audit Recommendations	
<u>St:</u> 1.	Partially Implemented 11/29/9	Status Date

#### 10. Recommendations Included in this Report.

Recommendation No.1: We recommend that the City Manager prepare a detailed proposal for consideration by the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners for consolidating motor equipment, building maintenance and street-related maintenance operations. For each activity, the proposal should include a determination of whether the City should modify the current system to enhance coordination between the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments, fully consolidate the activity in a single department, or partially consolidate the activity. The proposal should include a timetable for implementation for each activity.

Status: A partial consolidation has begun with the heavy equipment maintenance and repair section of the Parks and Recreation Department relocating its 17th and Woodland site to the Public Works equipment maintenance and repair central site, Municipal Service Center. Parks and Recreation currently has 2 heavy equipment mechanics, 3 automotive technicians, 2 automotive mechanics, and a motorized equipment supervisor working at the Municipal Service Center. In addition, the economy of scale savings for outside service contracts and preventative maintenance can be realized at this location. The two departments have appointed a transition coordination team and construction of appropriate supervisor offices and designation of work stations for Parks and Recreation staff has begun. Initially, the equipment repair crews of the two departments will work independently. However, when one department's staff is overloaded and the other has time available, work sharing will occur with charges made against the appropriate department. Parts will be obtained from a single, well stocked "store" at MSC. The Parks and Recreation fleet is being added to the GEMS 2000 fleet management system maintained by the Public Works Department.

# Audit Report Tracking System Audit Title: Consolidation of Selected Activities Report Date: November 29, 1996 12. Recommendations Included in this Report (continued)

#### Recommendation No. 1 (continued):

At this point, consolidation efforts in the areas of construction, building maintenance, and street-related maintenance have not occurred. Our position on these items remains the same as stated in our June 23, 1995 response to the original audit.

Parks and Recreation has recently started working with Jackson County on grounds maintenance contract document coordination. We are in an open position to participate with Public Works on street related maintenance, as well as, the possibility of Parks and Recreation working together with the Neighborhood and Community Services Department on vacant lot weed control.

Parks and Recreation established a city staff development coordinating committee a few years ago, which meets on a weekly basis with other city departments, architects, engineers, and developers to discuss projects of mutual concern. The Public Works Department staff are regular participants in these meetings.

Audit Report T	racking System
1. Audit Title	2. This Report Date
1. Audit Title CONSOLIDATION OF SELECTED ACTIVITIES: PARKS &	MAY 21, 1997
RECREATION AND PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENTS	WHI 21, 1997
3. Department	4. Last Report Date
PARKS & RECREATION AND PUBLIC WORKS	November 27, 1996
TANGO & RECREATIONARY TO SEE WORLD	
5. Department Head	6. Contact Person/Phone
TERRY DOPSON, DIRECTOR OF PARKS/RECREATION	MARK McHENRY/871-5781
AND ED WOLF, DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC WORKS	LARRY FREVERT/274-1778
7. Audit Release Date	8. ARTS Number
JULY 31, 1995	934-020-2
9. Status of All Recommendations	
	•
Status <u>Date</u>	Status <u>Date</u>
1. IN PROGRESS MAY 1997	
'	
10. Recommendations Included in this Report	
and Recreation Commissioners for consolidating motor equipmaintenance operations. For each activity, the proposal shoul current system to enhance coordination between the Parks and	oosal for consideration by the City Council and the Board of Parks aipment, construction, building maintenance, and street-related dinclude a determination of whether the City should modify the Recreation and Public Works departments, fully consolidate the activity. The proposal should also include a timetable for
smaller task forces. The task forces, consisting of cross departments the two departments. The task forces have addressed the following Motorized Building/Faci Construction Project Street/Boulevard The task forces were assigned the responsibility to compile a det functions of both departments. Using these inventories, the task work where cooperative efforts presently exist and where future of service by pursuing any of the four following strategies: 1) M	I Equipment lity Maintenance ects and Inspections Related Maintenance ailed inventory of the specific work area requirements and forces have developed detailed matrices identifying these areas of cooperation may occur to promote efficiency, economy and quality lodifying Current Operations, 2) Partial Consolidation, 3) ured by these four task forces are attached and made a part of this

PR&PWCON.DOC

VEHICLE	FLEET MA	VEHICLE FLEET MAINTENANCE	E	COOPERATIC	COOPERATION or CONSOLIDATION
	LIKE TASKS	SKS			of SERVICES
SPECIFIC AREAS FOR COOPERATION	MOTOR EQUIPMENT	PARKS & RECREATION	WATER	Current Level of Cooperation	Planned Level of Cooperation or Consolidation
GEMS 2000	Yes	Yes	Yes	Common Administrator	Consolidated.
VEHICLE SPEC WRITING	Yes	Yes	Yes	Parks & Motor Equip	Full coop Parks & Motor Equip.
VEHICLE PURCHASING	Yes	Yes	Yes	Common Municipal Contracts Metro wide.	ntracts Metro wide.
VEHICLE WARRANTY	Yes	No	No	Motor Equipment will d	Motor Equipment will do all warranty repairs as needed.
VEHICLE MAINTENANCE	Yes	Yes	Yes	Parks & Motor Equip	Full coop Parks & Motor Equip.
VEHICLE ROAD SERVICE	Yes	Yes	No	neavy venicles Only	Full coop Parks & Motor Equip.
WORK AREAS	Yes	Yes	No	Parks & Motor Equip	Full coop Parks & Motor Equip.
WORKLOAD SHARE	Yes	Yes	No	neavy venicies Oury Parks & Motor Equip	Full coop Parks & Motor Equip.
CUSTOMERS	Yes	Yes	Yes	Parks, Water, and ME	Limited Coop on an as needs basis in
EQUIPMENT SHARING	Yes	Yes	No	Parks & Motor Equip	development stages. Meet in early June. Full coop Parks & Motor Equip.
PARTS ADMINISTRATION	Yes	Yes	No	Parks & Motor Equip	Full coop Parks & Motor Equip.
PARTS PURCHASING	Yes	Yes	Ño	Parks & Motor Equip	Parks is progressively buying more and
PARTS DISTRIBUTION	Yes	Yes	No	Motor Equipment.	more parts inrough Motor Equipment.  Motor Equipment distributes parts to  Woter and Parks as needed
CONSUMABLES	Yes	Yes	N <sub>o</sub>	Motor Equipment.	Sold to all departments (room to expand).
FUELING	Yes	Yes	Yes		In the hands of Purchasing.
ADMINISTRATION	Yes	Yes	Yes	None	Room for rationalization of administrative functions.

Meeting with Water to finalize negotiations for ME to relinquish the Body Shop to Water's new facility. Meeting between ME and Parks on May 28 to discuss further cooperation and/or consolidation.

Sheet1

		BUILDING AND FACILITY MAINTENANCE COMMITTEE	ITENANCE COMMITTEE		
		CONSOLIDATION REPORT	PORT		
SPECIFIC WORK TASK	PARKS AND RECREATION	PUBLIC WORKS	CURRENT LEVEL OF	RECOMMENDATION	COMPLETION
	RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSIBILITY	COOPERATION		DATE
Elevator maintenance and	Contract administration of	Contract administration of	Contract is coordinated	Consolidate two elevator	5/1/97
	park owned facilities	city owned buildings	through Public Works	maintenance contracts into one	-
	等。 (1)	The second secon	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1	
City-wide Safety and	Full participation by	Full participation by	Both departments are	Continue this coordinated effort	Ongoing
99	committee members	committee members	participating fully		
を できない できない できない できない かんしゅう しゅうしゅう しゅう	A CONTRACTOR OF THE PARTY OF TH	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一 一		
	不是我是我们是一个一个一个一个一个				di d
Hardscape and Landscape	Assist Public Works with	Assist Parks and Recreation	Both departments provide	Complete a review of P.W.	
maintenance	expertise and resources	with expertise and resources	service for coordinated	facilities that may receive park	9/1/97
	in the area of landscaping	in the area of hardscape	effort when necessary	maintenance, pending resources	
を という という という こうかん こうかん こうかん こうかん こうかん こうかん こうかん こうか		· 曹林生 · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		The second secon	
Annual Service Contracts	Maintenance of all Park	Maintenance of all City	Individual departments	Award one contract for each type	5/1/97
	owned facilities and amenities	owned facilities	administer their contracts-	of work to be administered by	
				the using department	
		A CONTRACTOR OF THE PARTY OF TH			
Thermal and moisture	Maintenance of all Park	Maintenance of all City	Individual departments	Shared contract to maintain	5/1/97
protection	owned facilities and amenities	owned facilities	specify and administer	consistency and secure lowest bid	
			their own contracts	administered by using department	
				と 東方をの表示とはまするととというと	
Benchmarking	Develop and evaluate	Assessing and benchmarking	No current level of	Information and measurements be	11/1/97
		with other facility managers	cooperation	shared if similar work is performed	
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		一般 一	
Quarterly sharing sessions	None	None	No current level of	Begin quarterly sharing sessions	Ongoing
			coordination	immediately	
	di d				
Building inspections	Maintenance and evaluation	Maintenance and evaluation	None	Begin to utilize and standardize	2/1/98
and evaluation	of all Park owned facilities	of City owned facilities		all condition and assessment	
	and amenities			forms and developed a	
(の) 教養を持ている。			The state of the s	comprehensive inventory	1000 mm
	3374				70110
Fountain Maintenance	Maintenance of all Parks and	Maintenance of City Hall	Periodic consultation	Review possibility of Parks	/R/L/C
	Recreation fountains	fountains		assuming the maintenance &	
				operation of City Hall and others	

Page 1

SPECIFIC WORK TASKS		PUBLIC WORKS/PARK AND RECREATION CONSOLIDATION REPORT	PUBLIC WORKSPARK AND RECREATION CONSOLIDATION REPORT	3/1/1/3
	PARKS & REC RESPONSIBILITY	PUBLIC WORKS RESPONSIBILITY	CURRENT LEVEL OF COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION	RECOMMENDATION
Project Planning	By project spectalty	By project specialry	Bach department does planuing in its area of responsibility with unique projects for its respective customers. Each uses the other in their respective areas of expertise. Coordination is occurring at monthly park development meetings and by participation in the Transportation and Development Committee meetings.	No duplication of services identified Coordination should continue.
Project Desion: Bridge	Any on Blade and Parlmens	All others account - 19-3 1 10-1	A # # 1 = 3 =	
	Any on Divus and I alaways	Au outers except on blvds and rarkways	All bridges, storm and sanitary sewers are designed and	Consolidation Complete
Salmary Sewers	Any on blvds and rarkways or within rark land	All except interceptors and those on Park land		Consolidation Complete
Storm Sewers	Any on Blvds and Parkways or with in Park land	All except those on Park Land, Blvds and pkwys	Depts. Public Works administers most projects.	Consolidation Complete
Streets	Blvds and Parkways	All other streets		Cont'd Coord, and Joint Review
Curb and Sidewalk	Blyds and Parkways and Park Roads	All other etreete	Hoch Done to box comes of their commenced billister	Communication and John Neview
Pormostion Bealitte	All City and a standard and a standard	An outer success	LACH LEPT LAKES CARE OF THEIR OWN RESPONSIBILITIES.	Complete review by 9-1-97
Necreation racinities	All City owned	None	Parks handles all.	No Duplication
Landscape	All Blvds and Parkways and Park Facilities	All other streets and Public Facilities	Coordinated through Parks.	Cont'd Coord, and Joint Review
Fountains	All City owned	None	Darks handles all	NI- Daniel Line
Darbita Darildian			ו מווא אישוותוכט מווי	Ivo Dupacanon
ruone sunamgs	Community Centers and all Park buildings	All other buildings except Aviation and Water	Each Dept takes care of their own responsibilities.	Complete Review by 1-1-98
Street Lighting	Any on Blyds and Parkways and Park Roads	All other streets	All street lighting consolidated.	Consolidation Complete
Parks	All	None	Parks handles all.	No Duplication
1% for ART Programs		All	ART Administrator coordinates for all depts.	No Duplication
			Parks now participating in ULCC and Std's Committee.	
Contract Procedures Construction	All Parks Projects	All Public Works Projects	Both donostruents have been modeling with I am Aristian	Complete Com
	in and injure	ALL FUDIEC WORKS FTOJECES	both departments have been working with Law, Aviation and Water Services to develop standard General Contract	Continue Coordination
			Provisions that will be used for all City construction contracts	
			These will be completed by 4-30-97	
			Roth donte are methingline in a contract macroning	
			bout uepts, are participating in a contract processing.	
Professional Services	All Parks Projects	All Public Works Projects	Roth are narticinating in a ration of contracte with other	
			denorthments for the mirrose of standardization	Commissio her 4 1 00
			- 88	Complete by 4-1-96
Construction inspection	All Parks Projects	All Public Works Projects	Each department is handling its own responsibilities.	Complete review for possible
				Corisonnation by 9-1-97
haoms	All Parks Projects	All Public Works Projects, Property Surveys	Presently reviewing for possible consolidation.	Complete review by 6-1-97
		Cana Corner monuments		
Materials Lesting	All Parks projects by contract	All Public Works projects except specialties	Presently reviewing for possibility of Public Works	Complete review by 11-1-97
	0.00	such as geotech, welding and environmental	providing service to Parks at less cost.	
Project Tracking	All Parks Projects	All Public Works Projects	This activity is nerformed by each denartment as an integral	No further consideration should
			ייים הרוביה או להיינסייונים כל כשכו הכליתיייונים מי שוניפליתי	TWO ISSUES CONSTRUCTIONS STORING
			part of its service delivery and in that regard responds to its respective management and policy makers. Since this activity is spread throughout all levels of each organization, consolidation would be nearly impossible and we feel that	be given to this.
			no efficiencies would be gained.	

	STRE	STREET/BOULEVARD MAINTENANCE	ANCE	5/5/97	
		CONSOLIDATION REPORT			
SPECIFIC WORK TASKS	PARKS & REC. RESPONSIBILITY	PUBLIC WORKS RESPONSIBILITY	CURRENT LEVEL OF COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION	RECOMMENDATION	DATE OF COMP
Bridge Inspections	* Bridges on Blvds. and Parkways.	* Bridges on Streets and Roads.	* All Bridge Inspections consolidated through Public Works.	* Completed Consolidation	N/A
Bridge Repair and Construction	* Bridges on Blvds. and Parkways.	* Bridges on Streets and Roads.	* All Major Bridge Repair & Construction Projects are reviewed, designed & implemented through a coordinating committee	* Completed Consolidation	N/A
			consisting of both Depts. Public Works administers most projects by mutual consent.  * Minor Bridge Repairs Performed through Public Works.		
Large Box Culverts	* Blvds. & Parkways	· Streets & Roads	* All large box culvert repairs consolidated through Public Works.	* Completed Consolidation	N/A
Pavement Resurfacing	* Blvds., Parkways, Park Roads & Parking Lots.	* Street & Roads	* All resurfacing consolidated through Public Works.	* Completed Consolidation	NA
Catch Basins-Cleaning and Repair	* Blvds., Parkways and Park Roads.	* Streets & Roads	* All Repair & Cleaning Operations being consolidated in Water Services.	* Completed Consolidation	N/A
Signalization, Pavement Markings & Traffic Signage	* Bivds. & Parkways	* Streets & Roads	All Signalization, Pavement Markings & Traffic Signage Consolidated in Public Works.	* Completed Consollidation	N/A

Page 1

DATE OF COMP.	Y/N	NA	K'N	ĄN V	8/1/97	11/1/97	78/1/11
RECOMMENDATION	• Completed Consolidation	* Completed Consolidation	* No Consolidation necessary at this time.	* Completed Consolidation	Pursue Consolidation of remaining ditch maintenance operations through Public Works.	* Consolidate pre-bid conferences and bid openings.	schedule big openings mutually in order to secure lowest bids.
COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION	* The placement of emergency safety barri • Completed Consolidation ers, barricades & lights is coordinated through Public Works.	* All Street Lighting Consolidated	* Pedestrian & Ornamental Lighting on Blvds. & Parkways are maintained by Parks and Recreation.	* All Urban Forestry Services Consolidated through Parks and Recreation.	Most drainage ditch maintenance has been consolidated through Public Works	* Shared Contract specifications to maintain consistency.	vo areas of upplication.
PUBLIC WORKS RESPONSIBILITY	* Streets & Roads	* Streets & Roads	* None- Public Works does not maintain similar systems except by agreement with private sector. No consolidation necessary.	* Streets, Roads & Public Properties- * All tree services provided by Parks and Recreation by agreement.	* All public rights-of-ways.	* Major Arterials-Moderate level of ma- intenance. Approx. 9 sweepings per year.	
PARKS & REC. RESPONSIBILITY	* Blvds., Parkways & Park Areas	* Blvds. & Parkways	* Blvds. & Parkways	* Blvds., Parkways and Park Areas.	* Park Areas	* Blvds. & Parkways- High level of maintenance. Approx. 16 sweepings per year.	
SPECIFIC WORK TASKS	Placement of Emergency Safety Barriers	Street Lighting	Ornamental & Pedestrian Lighting	Urban Forestry Services; e.g. pruning, removals, & plantings.	Drainage Ditch Maintenance	Street Sweeping	

Page 2

RESPONSIBILITY	PUBLIC WORKS RESPONSIBILITY	CORRENT LEVEL OF	RECOMMENDATION	DATE OF
				200
	Downtown Streets-Intense level of		* Explore consolidation of Downtown	5/1/98
72 sweepings	maintenance. Approx. 72 sweepings		Sweeping Program	
	рег уеаг.	The second section of the section of th		1
			* Pursue Consolidation of remaining	5/1/99
*	Residential Streets-Minimum level of		sweeping program city-wide	
_	maintenance. Approx. 2 sweepings		through Public Works.	
	per year.			
$\neg$	* Traffic Islands-Moderate level of	* Shared contract specifications to main-	* Improve consistency in contract	8/1/97
maintenance. Approximately 26 mow-	maintenance. Approximately 7 mow-	tain consistency.	specifications.	
	ings/year.			
		* No areas of duplication.	* Consolidate pre-bid conferences	11/1/97
* Park Areas-High level of maintenance *	* Roadsides-Minimal level of mainte-		and bid openings.	
ıgs/year.	nance. Approximately 2-3 mowings			
	per year.		* Schedule bid openings mutually in	11/1/97
			order to secure lowest bids.	
*	Public Works Owned Vacant Lots-			
_	Moderate level of maintenance.		* Identify ways to share inspections	11/1/97
	Approximately 5 mowings per year.		of contractors.	
			* Pursue consolidation of mowing	5/1/99
			operations city-wide through	
			Parks and Recreation. Include	
			mowing performed by other city	
		WHERE I American Company of the Comp	departments, e.g. Water Services	
		Million of the second of the s	and Neighborhood & Community	
		A TAXABLE MANAGEMENT OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PR	Services.	
		A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A	7907 / 1017	
		The second secon		: : : : : : : : : : : : : : : : : : : :
•		THE RESIDENCE OF THE PARTY OF T	The second secon	

Page 3

DATE OF COMP.	8/1/97	11/1/97	11/1/97	5/1/99	5/1/98	8/1/97	8/1/97
RECOMMENDATION	Improve consistency in contract specifications.	* Schedule bid openings mutually in order to secure lowest bids.	* Consolidate pre-bid conferences and bid openings.	Pursue consolidation of the application of herbicides city wide. Include the application of herbicides by other city departments, e.g. Water Services.	• Pursue the consolidation of shoulder repairs & maintenance through Public Works.	* Pursue the consolidation of repairs and maintenance through Public Works.	Consolidate all pavement repairs through Public Works.
COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION	Shared confract specifications to maintain consistency.	* No areas of duplication.			• None	• None	* Public Works performs all pavement repairs on Blvds., Parkways, Streets & Roads. Parks & Recreation has continued to repair Park Roads & Parking Lots.
PUBLIC WORKS RESPONSIBILITY	* Downtown Streets- Application of non-selective herbicides to control vege-		* Rural Roads. Application of non-selective herbicides to eradicate vegetation	around guard rails & signs, & to eradicate noxious weeds.	* Streets & Roads- Performed on scheduled basis by Public Works crews.	* Streets & Roads- Performed as needed by Public Works crews.	* Blvds., Parkways, Streets & Roads.
PARKS & REC. RESPONSIBILITY	* Bivds. & Parkways- Application of selective herbi- cides for control of broadleaf	weeds in turf areas.			* Blvds., Parkways & Parks- Performed as needed by Parks and Recreation crews.	* Blvds., Parkways & Parks- Performed as needed by Parks and Recreation crews.	* Park Roads
SPECIFIC WORK TASKS	Application of Herbicides				Road Shoulder Repairs and Maintenance	Guard Rail Repair & Maint.	Pavement Repair

Page 4

7	
υ	
מכ	
a	
L	

SPECIFIC WORK TASKS	PARKS & REC. RESPONSIBILITY	PUBLIC WORKS RESPONSIBILITY	CURRENT LEVEL OF COOPERATIONICONSOLIDATION	RECOMMENDATION	DATE OF COMP.
ce and Snow Removal	* Blvds., Parkways, Park Roads and Parking Lots.	* Streets & Roads	* All ice & snow removal operations are centrally administered through Public Works.	Review routes and reconfigure to reduce travel time and improve effeciency.	10/1/97
The state of the s			* No areas of duplication.		:
Emergency Response	* City-Wide	* City-Wide	* Public Works & Parks and Recreation	* Continue review of emergency re-	8/1/97
			work closely together in responding to	sponse situations as part of a	
		William Company Color Co	any city emergency requiring an immedi-	concerted effort to make improve-	1
			ate response; e.g. snow storms, ice	ments.	
	100000000000000000000000000000000000000		storms, wind storms, floods, etc	The state of the s	

**Audit Report Tracking System** 1. Audit Title This Report Date Consolidation of Selected Activities: Parks & Recreation and November 25, 1997 Public Works Departments 4. Last Report Date 3. Department May 21, 1997 Parks & Recreation and Public Works 5. Department Head Contact Person/Phone Terry Dopson, Director of Parks & Recreation Mark McHenry @ 871-5781 and Larry Frevert @ 274-1778 and Ed Wolf. Director of Public Works 8. ARTS Number 7. | Audit Release Date 934-020-3 July 31, 1995

### 9. Status of All Recommendations

Status	<u>Da</u>	Status	<u>Date</u>

1. In Progress November 1997

RECEIVED
DEC 17 1997
CITY AUDITOR'S
OFFICE

### 10. Recommendations Included in this Report

1. We recommend that the City Manager prepare a detailed proposal for consideration by the City Council and the Board of Parks and Recreation Commissioners for consolidating motor equipment, construction, building maintenance and street-related maintenance operations. For each activity, the proposal should include a determination of whether the City should modify the current system to enhance coordination between the Parks and Recreation and Public Works Departments, fully consolidate the activity in a single department, or partially consolidate the activity. The proposal should also include a timetable for implementation of each activity.

<u>In Progress</u>: The staffs of the Parks and Recreation and Public Works Departments have continued to meet in cross-departmental task forces to address these specific functions. The task forces have been organized in the following general areas:

Motorized Equipment
Building/Facility Maintenance
Construction Projects and Inspections
Street/Boulevard Related Maintenance

Since the last ARTS report, the task forces have continued their efforts and the attached matrices provide up to date summaries of the activities to date. The matrices accompanying this report have been expanded to include a column identifying, where known, the value of the consolidation efforts. Completion dates have been updated for efforts not yet completed.

11/25/97

## Auditor's Report Tracking System Duplication of Services - Parks and Public Works

BON PAINTENANCE	TENANCE		COOPERATION or CONSOLIDATION		
LIKE TASKS	SKS		of SERVICES		
	_	0 02805 0	) at ranker to	-MOO	VALUE OF
SPECIFIC AREAS FOR COOPERATION	WORKS	REC.	NSOLIDATION	PLETED	CONSOL.
				- -	000 0010
GEMS 2000	YES	YES	Consolidated	Yes	3120,000
EOUIP, SPEC, WRITING	YES	YES	Full cooperation of Parks and P.W.	Yes	
			W d kee all all 2.	Yes	
VEHICLE PURCHASING	YES	YES	Full cooperation of Parks and P. W.	3	
VEHICLE WARRANTY	YES	YES. YES'	PW-\$54.00 X.T.D	Yes	S4,400
VEHICLE MAINTENANCE	YES	YES	Full cooperation of Parks and P.W.	Yes	
VEHICLE ROAD SERVICE	YES	YES	Full cooperation of Parks and P.W.	Yes	4 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1
				Ves	
WORK AREAS	YES	YES	Parks Heavy Equipment Section moved to M.S.C.	IGS	
WORKLOAD SHARE	. YES	YES	Full coop Parks and PW share labor as needed	Yes	
			The state of the s	Vec	
CUSTOMERS	YES	YES	Full coop Parks and ME snare as necessar		
EQUIPMENT SHARING	YES	YES	Full cooperation of Parks and P.W.	Yes	
PARTS ADMINISTRATION	YES	YES	Full cooperation of Parks and P.W.	Yes	
PARTS PURCHASING	WES - WILL	VES WITH YES WE	Last year \$3,343; this Y. T.D \$16,073	Yes	\$19,416
	A Taring State of the Control of the	Ash little contact the contact to the			
PARTS DISTRIBUTION	YES	NO	PW distributes parts to Parks as needed	Yes	
CONSUMABLES	YES	NO	Commodities sold to all	Yes	
FUELING	YES	YES	Parks now using PW fueling sites	Yes	
INOTAL GOOD PARTY AND	SEL	VEC	Evil conseration of Parks and P W	Yes	
ADMINISTRATION	153	3	TOTAL		\$143,816
			Section of the sectio		
*	HEMS 2000 System I cone-time savings of	now used by Aviati \$70,000 realized to	GEMS 2000, System now used by Avjation, Weier, Parks and Public Worts. A one-ture septings of \$70,000 realized by the City by MOT duplicating.		
	ardware in FY 97.	A one-time sayings by the software ve			
	and the same of th				

SPECIFIC WORK TASK PARKS AND RECRETYON PUBLIC WORKS CURRENT TEVEL OF RECOMMENDATION CONFILETOR STATUS CONSCILIDATION (ALL MANIER CONFIDENCE CON			BUILDING AND FACILITY COMMITTEE	COMMITTEE			
TASK PARKS AND RECREATION PUBLIC WORKS CURRENT LEVEL OF RECOMMENDATION GYNPLETING  TO Contract administration of Park Contract administration of Contract administration of Contract administration of Park Contract administration of Contract ad			CONSOLIDATION REPO	T}			
RESPONSIBILITY   RESPONSIBILITY   COOPERATION   CONTROL is coordinated of Control in order of Control in Con	SPECIFIC WORK TASK	PARKS AND RECREATION	PUBLIC WORKS	CURRENT LEVEL OF	RECOMMENDATION	COMPLETION	VALUE OF
Full participation by Contract administration of Park owned facilities  Full participation by Full participation by Full participation by Committee members  Assast Public Works with  Assast Public Works Works Public Works Work	The second secon	RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSIBILITY	COOPERATION		STATUS	CONSOLIDATION
Contract administration of Contract stannishtation of Contract is coordinated Controlled Novels							
Full participation by   Full participation   Full participation by   Full participation   Full	Elevator maintenance and		Contract administration of		Consolidate two elevator	COMPLETE	\$2,500
Full participation by   Full participation by   Committee members   Participation by   Participating fully   Participating fully participating fully	inspection	Park owned facilities	city owned buildings	through Public Works	maintenance contracts into one		
Full participation by Craimittee members   Committee members   Market below   Market belo							
Committee members   Committee members   Participating fully   Committee members   Committee members   Participating fully	City-wide Safety and	Full participation by	Full participation by	Both departments are	Continue this coordinated effort	COMPLETE	undetermined
tracis Maintenance of all Park owned facilities and annual facilities and resources and resources service for coordinated facilities that may receive park Majves in the area of hardscape from the area of landscaping in the area of hardscape from the area of landscaping in the area of landscaping in the area of landscape from the area of landsc	Security Committee	committee members	committee members	participating fully			
Packet Public Vorcks with   Assist Packet Public Vorcks with   Assist Packet Public Vorcks with   Packet Public Vorcks   Packet Public Vorc							
Expertise and resources   With expertise and resources   Service for coordinated   Contract	Hardscape and Landscape	Assist Public Works with	Assist Parks and Recreation	Both departments provide	Complete a review of P.W.	May-98	undetermined
in the area of landscaping in the area of hardscape affort when necessary maintenance per contract in the area of landscaping of administer their contract for each type (COMPLETE Labor Maintenance of all Park Maintenance of all City and administer their contract for each type (COMPLETE administered by using department moisture owned facilities and amenities of more facilities and amenities of more facilities and amenities owned facilities and amenities of more facilities and amenities of amenities of more facilities and amenities and amenities of contract work facilities and amenities and amenit	maintenance	expertise and resources	with expertise and resources	service for coordinated	facilities that may receive park		-
Maintenance of all Park   Maintenance of all City   Individual departments   Avarid one contract for each type   COMPLETE   Labor		in the area of landscaping	in the area of hardscape	effort when necessary	maintenance, pending resources		
Maintenance of all Park   Maintenance of all City   Individual departments   Award one contract for each type   COMPLETE   Labor							
owned facilities and amenities         owned facilities and amenities         administer their contracts         of work to be administered by one and administered by using department         Malerial formation and administered by using department         Malerial formation and administered by using department         Malerial formation and administered by using department         COMPLETE           Develop and evaluate         Assessing and benchmarking         No current level of performance measures         Individual department and administered by using department         May-96         May-96           Invoice performance measures         with other facility managers         cooperation         Information and it shall work is performed         May-96         May-96           Invoice and evaluation         Maintenance and evaluation         None         Coordination         None         Dec-96           Invoice administration of Park owned facilities         Invoice administration of Park owned facilities         Invoice and eveluation         None         Dec-96           Invoice evaluation         Maintenance evaluation         None         Invoice and eveluation         None         Dec-96           Invoice evaluation and administration of Park owned         Contract development, and administration before a congrete the long term costs         Apr-96           Contract evaluation and administration before a all parks and administration before a land part of administration of Park owned         April pa	Annual Service Contracts	Maintenance of all Park	Maintenance of all City	Individual departments	Award one contract for each type	COMPLETE	Labor 18% savings
Maintenance of all Park . Maintenance of all City individual departments is shared contract to maintain connect and amenities owned facilities and amenities of the contract of the contrac		owned facilities and amenities	owned facilities	administer their contracts	of work to be administered by		Material 6% savings
Maintenance of all Park         Maintenance of all Park         Maintenance of all Park         Maintenance of all Park         COMPLETE           Owned facilities and amenities         Owned facilities and amenities         Owned facilities and amenities         Owned facilities and amenities         May-308           Develop and evaluate         Assessing and benchmarking         No current level of information and measurements be performed and reassurements be with other facility managers         No current level of information and measurements be with other facility managers         No current level of information and measurements be with other facility managers         No current level of information and reassurements be shall all own in the second and assessing and amenities         May-308           Ions         None         No current level of or all park owned facilities         No current level of or all park owned facilities         Dec-38           Internation and amenities         of all park owned facilities         of City owned facilities         No current level or ontition and assessment forms         Dec-38           Internation and amenities         of contract evaluation and accuration and administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration of Park owned facilities         No condition and accuration of Park owned facilities         No reproduct levelopment, and administration of Park owned facilities         No reproduct levelopment, and administration of Park owned				hvac, plumbing, electrical	the using department		
Maintenance of all Park         Maintenance of all City         Individual departments         Shared contract to maintain         COMPLETE           owned facilities and amenities         owned facilities         specify and administer         consistence by using department         May-98         0           Develop and evaluate         Assessing and benchmarking         No current level of information and measurements be performed         May-98         0           sions         None         Maintenance and evaluation         None         No current level of information and assessment from sessing and evaluation         No current level of information and assessment from sessions         COMPLETE           do all Park owned facilities         None         Begin quarterly sharing sessions         COMPLETE           and amenities         of City owned facilities         Inventor         Begin quarterly sharing sessions         Dec-98           and amenities         of City owned facilities         Inventor         Inventory         Dec-98           and amenities         contract development, and administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration of Park owned evaluation and assessment from some and administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration of City Park or evaluation fountains							
owned facilities and amenities         owned facilities         specify and administer         consistency and secure lowest bid           Develop and evaluate         Assessing and benchmarking         No current level of performance measures         Information and measurements be performed         May-98           sions         None         No current level of cooperation         Begin quarterly sharing sessions         COMPLETE           sions         None         No current level of coordination         Begin quarterly sharing sessions         COMPLETE           dial Park owned facilities         of city owned facilities         and amenities         and develop a comprehensive         no confination           daministration of Park waned         contract evaluation         No Public Works' properties         Inventor         Contract development, level of contract evaluations         No Public Works' properties         Inventor           facilities         on Public Works' properties         fully participating         based on evaluations         Apr-98           maintenance of all Parks and         Maintenance of all Parks and         Maintenance of all Parks and         Apr-98	Thermal and moisture	Maintenance of all Park	Maintenance of all City	Individual departments	Shared contract to maintain	COMPLETE	\$2,500
Interior own contracts   Assessing and benchmarking   No current level of   Information and measurements be   May-98   Develop and evaluate   Assessing and benchmarking   No current level of   Information and measurements be   May-98   Develop and evaluation   None   No current level of   Information and measurements be   May-98   Develop and evaluation   None   Begin quarterly sharing sessions   COMPLETE	protection	owned facilities and amenities	owned facilities	specify and administer	consistency and secure lowest bid		
Develop and evaluate         Assessing and benchmarking         No current level of performance measures         Information and measurements be with other facility managers         No coperation         Information and measures         May-98           None         None         None         No current level of all Park owned facilities         Begin quarterly sharing sessions         COMPLETE           Maintenance and evaluation         Maintenance and evaluation         Maintenance and evaluation         None         Begin to utilize and standardize         Dec-98           of all Park owned facilities         or City owned facilities         and develop a comprehensive         Dec-98           and amenities         contract evaluation and evaluation, and administration         New since last report         Continue this coordinated effort         Dec-98           Contract evaluation, and evaluation, and administration         both departments are to decrease the long term costs         Apr-98           Administration of Park owned         evaluation, and administration         Italify participating         based on evaluations           Administration of Park owned         evaluation, and administration         Italify participating         Apr-98           Maintenance of all Parks and         Maintenance of City Hall         Periodic consultation         Apr-98           Recreation fountains         and Barney Allis fountains         ope				their own contracts	administered by using department		
Develop and evaluate         Assessing and benchmarking         No current level of performation         Information and measurements be performed         May-95           performance measures         with other facility managers         cooperation         shared if similar work is performed         COMPLETE           None         No current level of None         Begin quarterly sharing sessions         COMPLETE           Maintenance and evaluation         Maintenance and evaluation         None         Begin quarterly sharing sessions         Dec-98           of all Park owned facilities         of City owned facilities         and amenties         and develop a comprehensive         nor City owned facilities         nor City owned facilities         nor City owned facilities         nor public works' properties         facilities         nor develop a comprehensive         nor develop a comprehensive           Contract evaluation and evaluation and amenities         contract development, and administration both departments are to develop a comprehensive         linventory         nor development, administration both departments are to decrease the long term costs         nor public Works' properties         facilities         hor decrease the long term costs         Apr-98           Maintenance of all Parks and Maintenance of City Hall         Periodic consultation         Review possibility of Parks         Apr-98           Recreation fountains         and Barney Allis fountains							
performance measures         with other facility managers         cooperation         shared if similar work is performed           None         None         Begin quarterly sharing sessions         COMPLETE           Maintenance and evaluation         Maintenance and evaluation         None         Begin to utilize and standardize         Dec-98           of all Park owned facilities         of City owned facilities         Inventory         and develop a comprehensive         Dec-98           and amenities         Inventory         Inventory         Inventory         Dec-98           Contract evaluation and administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration         Contract levaluations         New since last report         Continue this coordinated effort         Dec-98           administration of Park owned         evaluation, and administration         Not decrease the long term costs         Dec-98           facilities         on Public Works' properties         fully participating         based on evaluations         Apr-98           Maintenance of all Parks and         Maintenance of City Hall         Periodic consultation         Review possibility of Parks         Apr-98           Recreation fountains         and Barney Allis fountains         Operation of City Hall and others         Apr-98		Develop and evaluate	Assessing and benchmarking	No current level of	Information and measurements be	May-98	
None         No current level of administration of all Parks owned facilities         No current level of all Parks and amentales         No current level of all Parks and amentales         Contract evaluation of all Parks and amentales         None         Begin to utilize and standardize         Dec-98           of all Park owned facilities         of city owned facilities         and develop a comprehensive         Dec-98           and amentiles         and develop a comprehensive         Inventory           Contract evaluation and administration both departments are administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration both departments are facilities         Inventory           Maintenance of all Parks and Maintenance of City Hall Recreation fountains         Periodic consultation         Review possibility of Parks         Apr-38           Recreation fountains         and Barney Allis fountains         periodic consultation of City Hall and others         Apr-38		performance measures	with other facility managers	cooperation	shared if similar work is performed		
None         No current level of accidination         Begin quarterly sharing sessions         COMPLETE           Maintenance and evaluation of all park owned facilities         Maintenance and evaluation         None         Begin to utilize and standardize         Dec-96           of all Park owned facilities         of City owned facilities         and develop a comprehensive         Dec-96           and amenities         inventory         inventory         Dec-98           Contract evaluation and contract development, administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration both departments are facilities         Inventory         Continue this coordinated effort         Dec-98           Administration of Park owned facilities         evaluations         fully participating         based on evaluations         Apr-98           Maintenance of all Parks and Maintenance of City Hall         Periodic consultation         Review possibility of Parks         Apr-98           Recreation fountains         and Barney Allis fountains         peration of City Hall and others         operation of City Hall and others							
Maintenance and evaluation   Maintenance and evaluation   Mone   Begin to utilize and standardize   Dec-36     Inventor   Maintenance and evaluation   Mone   Begin to utilize and standardize   Dec-36     Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Inventor     Contract evaluation and   Contract development,   New since last report   Continue this coordinated effort   Dec-36     Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Dec-36     Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Dec-36     Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Dec-36     Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Dec-36     Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Dec-36     Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Inventor   Inventor     Inventor	Quarterly sharing sessions		None	No current level of	Begin quarterly sharing sessions	COMPLETE	undetermined
Maintenance and evaluation         Mointenance and evaluation         None         Begin to utilize and standardize         Dec-96           of all Park owned facilities         of City owned facilities         of City owned facilities         and develop a comprehensive         and develop a comprehensive           t         Contract evaluation and administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration of Park owned on Public Works' properties         fully participating         based on evaluations         Dec-98           facilities         on Public Works' properties         fully participating         based on evaluations         Apr-98           se         Maintenance of all Parks and minimance of City Hall         Periodic consultation         Review possibility of Parks         Apr-98           Recreation fountains         and Barney Allis fountains         periodic consultation of City Hall and others         operation of City Hall and others         peration of City Hall and others				coordination			
Maintenance and evaluation         Mone         Begin to utilize and standardize         Dec-98           of all Park owned facilities         of all Park owned facilities         of City owned facilities         and develop a comprehensive         and develop a comprehensive           t         Contract evaluation and administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration of Park owned administration of Parks and Maintenance of all Parks and Maintenance of City Hall         New since last report Percentage to decrease the long term costs         Dec-98           se         Maintenance of all Parks and Maintenance of City Hall         Periodic consultation         Review possibility of Parks         Apr-98           Recreation fountains         and Barney Allis fountains         periodic consultation of City Hall and others         peration of City Hall and others         peration of City Hall and others							
of all Park owned facilities         of City owned facilities         and develop a comprehensive           and amenities         and develop a comprehensive         and develop a comprehensive           issuent         Contract evaluation and administration of Park owned         Contract development, and administration both departments are administration of Park owned         New since last report         Continue this coordinated effort         Dec-98           facilities         on Public Works' properties         fully participating         based on evaluations         Apr-98           fenance         Maintenance of all Parks and         Maintenance of City Hall         Periodic consultation         Review possibility of Parks         Apr-98           Recreation fountains         and Barney Allis fountains         operation of City Hall and others         operation of City Hall and others	Building inspections	Maintenance and evaluation	Maintenance and evaluation	None	Begin to utilize and standardize	Dec-98	
and amenities and amenities and are already and develop a comprehensive and develop a comprehensive inventory  Assessment Contract evaluation and Contract development, New since last report Continue this coordinated effort Dec-98 administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration both departments are to decrease the long term costs fully participating based on evaluations  Amintenance of all Parks and Maintenance of City Hall Periodic consultation Review possibility of Parks Apr-98  Recreation fountains and Barney Allis fountains periodic consultation operation of City Hall and others	and evaluation		of City owned facilities		all condition and assessment forms		
Assessment Contract evaluation and Contract development, New since last report Continue this coordinated effort Dec-98 administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration both departments are to decrease the long term costs facilities on Public Works' properties fully participating based on evaluations  Maintenance of all Parks and Maintenance of City Hall Periodic consultation assuming the maintenance and sasuming the maintenance and periodic contract operation of City Hall and Others		and amenities			and develop a comprehensive		
Assessment Contract evaluation and Contract development, New since last report Continue this coordinated effort Dec-96 administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration both departments are to decrease the long term costs facilities on Public Works' properties fully participating based on evaluations  Maintenance of all Parks and Maintenance of City Hall Periodic consultation Review possibility of Parks Apr-98 Recreation fountains and Barney Allis fountains operation of City Hall and others					inventory		
Assessment Contract devaluation and Contract development, both departments are administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration both departments are to decrease the long term costs Dec-96 administration of Park owned evaluation, and administration both departments are to decrease the long term costs Carlo							
administration of Park owned         evaluation, and administration         both departments are facilities         to decrease the long term costs           Maintenance         On Public Works' properties         fully participating         based on evaluations           Maintenance of all Parks and Recreation fountains         Maintenance of all Parks and Barney Allis fountains         Periodic consultation         Review possibility of Parks         Apr-98           Recreation fountains         and Barney Allis fountains         poperation of City Hall and others         Apr-98	Roofing Assessment	Contract evaluation and	Contract development,	New since last report	Continue this coordinated effort	Dec-98	undetermined
Maintenance         Maintenance of all Parks and Recreation fountains         And Barney Allis fountains         Periodic consultation         Review possibility of Parks         Apr-98           Recreation fountains         and Barney Allis fountains         periodic consultation         assuming the maintenance and poperation of City Hall and others         poperation of City Hall and others	Program	administration of Park owned	evaluation, and administration	both departments are	to decrease the long term costs		
Maintenance of all Parks and Maintenance of City Hall Periodic consultation Review possibility of Parks Apr-98 Recreation fountains and Barney Allis fountains operation of City Hall and others		facilities	on Public Works' properties	fully participating	based on evaluations		
Maintenance of all Parks and Recreation fountains         Maintenance of all Parks         Apr-98           Recreation fountains         and Barney Allis fountains         assuming the maintenance and others							
and Barney Allis fountains	Fountain Maintenance	Maintenance of all Parks and	Maintenance of City Hall	Periodic consultation	Review possibility of Parks	Apr-98	
operation of City Hall and others		Recreation fountains	and Barney Allis fountains		assuming the maintenance and		
					operation of City Hall and others		

Page 1

PUBLIC WORKS/PARKS AND RECREATION CONSOLIDATION REPORT

				DESCOURIE NO 4 TO W	VALUE OF
SPECIFIC WORK TASKS	PARKS & RECREATION	PUBLIC WORKS	COORERATIONCONSOLIDATION		CONSOLIDATION
	RESPONSIBILIT	near Original I	T		
Project Planning	By project specialty	By project specialty		ntified	NA
			with unique projects for its respective customers. Each uses C	Coordination should continue.	
			the other in their respective areas of expertise.		
			Coordination is occurring at monthly park development		
			meetings and by participation in the Transportation and		
	3		Development Committee meetings.		
Project Design:					NIA '
Bridges	Any on Blvds and Parkways			Consolidation Complete	IVA
Sanitary Sewers	Any on Blvds and Parkways or within Park land	All except interceptors and those on Park land	se from both	Consolidation Complete	NA
Storm Sewers	Any on Blvds and Parkways or with in Park land	Any on Blvds and Parkways or with in Park land All except those on Park Land, Blvds and pkwys   Depts. Pub Wks administers most projects.		Consolidation Complete	N/A
Streets	Blvds and Parkways	All other streets	projects	Cont'd Coord, and Joint Review	
Curb and Sidewalk	Blyds and Parkways and Park Roads	All other streets	Each Dept takes care of their own responsibilities	Complete review by 9-1-97 - Each	Unknown
				Department takes care of their own	
				responsibilities. Coordination will	
				continue through joint participation in	-
				various committees.	
Recreation Facilities	All City owned	None	Parks handles all	No Duplication	N/A
l andscape	All Blyds and Parkways and Park Facilities	All other streets and Public Facilities	Coordinated through Parks	Cont'd Coord, and Joint Review	
Fountains	All City owned	None	Parks handles all	No Duplication	NA
outhin Duilding	Community Centers and all Park hylldings	All other huldings except Aviation and Water	Each Dent takes care of their own responsibilities	Complete Review by 1-1-98 - No	
במווחות בחומו ב	Sering of the series of the se			apparent advantages to consolidation.	
Otrock Linking	Any on Blyde and Parkways and Park Boads	All other streets	All street lighting consolidated	Consolidation Complete	NA
Darks	All	None	Parks handles all	No Duplication	NA
			Parks now participating in ULCC and Std's Committee		
Contract Procedures:			All	Oscillario Oscillarion	
Construction	All Parks Projects	All Public Works Projects	Boin departments have been working with Law, Aviation		
			and Water Services to develop standard General Contract		
	-		Provisions that will be used for all City construction confidents		
			These will be completed by 4-30-97.		
			Both depts. are participating in a contract processing		
			committee with other contracting departments.		
Professional Services	All Parks Projects	All Public Works Projects	Both are participating in a review of contracts with other		
			departments for the purpose of standardization.	Complete by 4-1-98	
Construction Inspection	All Parks Projects	All Public Works Projects	Each department is handling its own responsibilities.	Complete review for possible	\$320,000.00
				consolidation by 9-1-97 - Coordination	
				has increased from joint participation	
				in ULCC and Standards Committees.	
				Parks is administering tree trimming	
				function of new P.W. Street Light	
				Program. Departments will	
				continue to identify and	
				evaluate specific	
				opportunities where	

# PUBLIC WORKS/PARKS AND RECREATION CONSOLIDATION REPORT

	<u> </u>	_	-			_					-	T								Ī		T	
VALUE OF	CONSOLIDATION		WEST	Unknown														N/A ·					
RECOMMENDATION		coordination can improve overall	operation.	Complete review by 6-1-97 -	Coordination has increased from joint	participation in ULCC and Standards	Committees. Departments will	continue to identify and evaluate	specific opportunities where	coordination can improve overail	operation.	Complete review by 11-1-97 - Parks will	research, track and forecast testing	needs. P.W. will gather performance	data and evaluate capacity to handle	additional workload. Analysis will be	completed 4/30/98.	No further consideration should	be given to this.				
CURRENT LEVEL OF	COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION			Presently reviewing for possible consolidation								Presently reviewing for possibility of Public Works						This activity is performed by each department as an integral	part of its service delivery and in that regard responds to its	respective management and policy makers. Since this	activity is spread throughout all levels of each organization,	consolidation would be nearly impossible and we feel that	no efficiencies would be gained
PUBLIC WORKS	RESPONSIBILITY			All Public Works Projects, Property Surveys								All Public Works projects except specialties	L					All Public Works Projects					
PARKS & RECREATION	RESPONSIBILITY			All Parks Projects	The state of the s		The state of the s	The state of the s				All Parks projects by contract						All Parks Projects					
SPECIFIC WORK TASKS				Survey								Motoriale Tastina	macina coming		A THE PARTY OF THE			Project Tracking					

		The state of the s				
	Ö	CONSOLIDATION REPORT				
		AVIACIO DE LA LA	TO 151/12   TANDOLLY	NOITAGNAMACORIA	DATEOF	711187
SPECIFIC WORK	PARKS & REC.	PUBLIC WORKS	COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION		COMP	
TASKS	KESTONSIBILITY	A STANDING TO THE STANDING TO				
Bridge Inspections	* Bridges on Blvds. and Parkways.	* Bridges on Streets and Roads.	* All Bridge Inspections consolidated	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	V/A	N/A
			through Public Works.		-	
	# Delate on Blade and Defausite	* Bridge on Streets and Roads	* All Major Bridge Repair & Construction	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	A/N	N/A
Construction	Bridges of Bryds: and r arways.		Projects are reviewed, designed & imple-			
			mented through a coordinating committee	and the state of t		
		The state of the s	consisting of both Depts. Public Works			
			administers most projects by intitual con-			
					-	
			* Minor Bridge Repairs Performed through Public Works.			
			The state of the s			
Large Box Culverts	* Blvds. & Parkways	* Streets & Roads	* All large box culvert repairs consolidated through Public Works.	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	<b>Y</b> X	¥
Pavement Resurfacing	* Blvds., Parkways, Park Roads &	* Street & Roads	* All resurfacing consolidated through	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	ΑΝ	Y/A
	Parking Lots.		Public Works.			
			1041 4111	#	VIV	MIA
Catch Basins-Cleaning and Repair	* Bivds., Parkways and Park Roads.	* Streets & Roads	All Repair & Cleaning Operations being consolidated in Water Services.	Consolidated Frior to Audit	2	CŽ
tromoned actionic	* Blude & Barkwaye	* Streets & Roads	* All Signalization. Pavement Markings &	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	N/A	N/A
Signalization, ravellien Markings & Traffic Signage	Division of division of		Traffic Signage Consolidated in Public Works.			
Placement of Emergency	* Blyds., Parkways & Park Areas	* Streets & Roads	* The placement of emergency safety barri-	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	N/A	N/A
Safety Barriers			ers, barricades & lights is coordinated through Public Works.		-	
Street Lighting	* Blvds. & Parkways	* Streets & Roads	* All Street Lighting Consolidated	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	N/A	Y.
Ornamental & Dodestrian	* Blvds & Parkways	* None-	* Pedestrian & Ornamental Lighting on	* No Consolidation necessary at	A/A	ΝA
Lighting	Diago, et allering	Public Works does not maintain	Blvds. & Parkways are maintained by	this time.		
0		similar systems except by agree-	Parks and Recreation.			
		solidation necessary.				
				-		4514
Urban Forestry Services; e.g. pruning, removals, &	* Blvds., Parkways and Park Areas.	* Streets, Roads & Public Properties- All tree services provided by Parks	* All Urban Forestry Services Consolidated through Parks and Recreation.	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	YN	Y.
plantings.		and Recreation by agreement.				

VALUE	0	0	0	0	N/A			N. N.	Pub. Wrk Receives Revenue of \$156,000	
DATE OF COMP.	11/1/97	11/1/97	11/1/97	11/1/97		10/1/97		3/1/98	5/1/98	
RECOMMENDATION	* Consolidation Completed	Consolidation Completed	Consolidation Completed	Consolidation Completed	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	* Reviewed routes and reconfigured to reduce travel time and improve effeciency for 1997-98.	Continue annual relivew.	Consolidated Prior to Audit     Continue annual review of emergency response situations as part of a concerted effort to make improvements.	Consolidate sweeping of boulevards, parkways, and streets through the Public Works Department on annual agreement.	
COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION	* All drainage ditch maintenance has been consolidated through Public Works	Public Works performs all shoulder repairs and maintenance city-wide.	* Public Works performs all guard rail repairs and maintenance city-wide.	Public Works performs all pavement repairs on Blvds., Parkways, Streets, Roads and Parking Lots as needed, city-wide.	* All ice & snow removal operations are centrally administered through Public	Works. Found no areas of duplication.	Continue to review loe and Snow operations annually as part of on-going efforts to improve efficiency & effectiveness between departments.	* Public Works & Parks and Recreation work closely together in responding to any city emergency requiring an immedi- ate response; e.g. snow storms, ice storms, wind storms, floods, etc	Found no areas of duplication.     Reviewing a proposed contract with the Public Works Department to provide Street Sweeping services on Boulevards, Parkways, and Park streets.	
PUBLIC WORKS RESPONSIBILITY	* All public rights-of-ways.	* Streets & Roads- Performed on scheduled basis by Public Works crews.	* Streets & Roads- Performed as needed by Public Works crews.	* Blvds., Parkways, Streets & Roads.	* Streets & Roads			• City-Wide	* Major Arterials-High level of ma- Infenance. Approx. 16 sweepings per year.	Downtown Streets-Intense level of maintenance. Approx. 96 sweepings per year.     Residential Streets-Minimum level of maintenance. Approx. 5 sweepings per year.
PARKS & REC. RESPONSIBILITY	* Park Areas	* Blvds., Parkways & Parks. Performed as needed by Parks and Recreation crews.	* Blvds., Parkways & Parks. Performed as needed by Parks and Recreation crews.	• Park Roads	* Blvds., Parkways, Park Roads and Parking Lots.	0		• City-Wide	* Blvds. & Parkways- High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.	* Downtown Blvds Intense level of maintenance. Approx. 96 sweepings per year.
SPECIFIC WORK TASKS	Drainage Ditch Maintenance	Road Shoulder Repairs and Maintenance	Guard Rail Repair & Maint.	Pavement Repair	Ice and Snow Removal			Emergency Response Efforts	Street Sweeping	

, . .

(r)	
0	
ā	
ä	
۵.	

SPECIFIC WORK	PARKS & REC.	PUBLIC WORKS	CURRENT LEVEL OF	RECOMMENDATION	DATE OF	VALUE
TASKS	RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSIBILITY	COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION		COMP.	
Mowing Turf	* Blvds . & Parkways-Intense level	* Traffic Islands-Moderate level of	<ul> <li>Found no areas of duplication.</li> </ul>	* Pursue consolidation of grounds	10/1/98	¥.
The state of the s	of maintenance. Approximately 26	maintenance. Approximately 7		maintenance operations city-wide		Possible
	to 28mowings per year.	to 13 mowings per year.		through Parks and Recreation. Inclu-		Savings
			* Formulating plans to consolidate the Ad-	des mowing performed by other city		Through
	* Park Areas-High level of maintenance	* Roadsides-Minimal level of mainte-	ministration of Grounds Maintenance Con-	departments, e.g. Water Services and		Centralized
Additional and the second seco	Approximately 14 mowings/year.	nance. Approximately 5 mowings	tracts through Parks and Recreation.	Neighborhood & Community Services.	-	Bidding
THE PARTY OF THE P		per year.				
William Control of the Control of th			<ul> <li>Working with Law Department on standard-</li> </ul>			
		* Public Works Owned Vacant Lots-	izing contract documents.			
		Moderate level of maintenance.				
		Approximately 9 mowings per year.				
Application of Herbicides	* Blvds. & Parkways-	* Downtown Streets-	* Found no areas of duplication.	* Pursue Consolidation of the appli-	10/1/98	N/A
	Application of selective herbi-	Application of non-selective		cation of herbicides city wide		Possible
	cides for control of broadleaf	herbicides to control vege-	<ul> <li>Formulating plans to consolidate the Ad-</li> </ul>	through Parks and Recreation. In-		Savings
	weeds in turf areas. Single	tation in sidewalks, curbs	ministration of Herbicide Spraying contracts	cludes the application of herbicides by		Through
	application annually.	and streets.	through Parks & Recreation.	other city departments, e.g Water		Centralized
				Services.		Bidding
Andrews of the state of the sta		* Rural Roads-	<ul> <li>Working with Law Department on standard-</li> </ul>			-
		Application of non-selective	izing contract documents.			
		herbicides to eradicate vegetation	A CONTRACTOR OF THE CONTRACTOR			
	•	around guard rails & signs, & to	Ty.			
		eradicate noxious weeds.				

$\mathbf{A}\mathbf{u}\mathbf{d}$	lit Report	Tracking System	A STUDY
1. Audit Title Consolidation of Selected Activities		2. This Report Date May 26, 1998	RECEIVED
Recreation and Public Works Departmen 3. Department Parks & Recreation and Public Works	its	4. Last Report Date November 25, 1997	CITY AUDITOR'S OFFICE
5. Department Head  Terry Dopson, Director of Parks & Read Ed Wolf, Director of Public Works		6. Contact Person/Phone Mark McHenry @ 871-5781 and Larry Frevert @ 274-1778	THE THE PARTY OF T
7. Audit Reiease Date July 31, 1995		8. ARTS Number 934-020-3	
9. Status of All Audit Recommenda	tions		
Status	Date	Status	Date
1. In Progress	May 1998		
	•		
10. Recommendations Included in	this Report		
1. We recommend that the City Manag and the Board of Parks and Recreatio building maintenance and street-rela include a determination of whether t between the Parks and Recreation and department, or partially consolidate implementation of each activity. In Pargress: The staffs of the Parks	n Commissioners ted maintenance he City should Public Works D the activity	for consolidating motor equipment operations. For each activity, t modify the current system to enhan epartments, fully consolidate the The proposal should also include	, construction, he proposal should see coordination activity in a single a timetable for

																		11	endices
		. •			•										om to expan				
					•				pepeal	oment stages			Jh PW	nd Parks as needed	os and departments ro		functions		
									share labor as n	basis in develor			nore parts throug	parts to Water a	nvestment group	ng division	of administrative		
 ONSOLIDATION CES	PLANNED L LEVEL OF COOP or CONSOLIDATION	Consolidated	Full Coop Parks and PW	Full Coop Parks and PW	s as required	Full Coop Parks and PW	Full Coop Parks and PW	Full Coop Parks and PW	Full Coop Parks and PW share labor as needed	Limited Coop on a needs basis in development stages	Full Coop Parks and PW	Full Coop Parks and PW	Parks buying more and more parts through PW	Public Works distributes parts to Water and Parks as needed	Consumables sold to all investment groups and departments room to expan	In the hands of purchasing division	Room for rationalization of administrative functions		
COOPERATION or CONSOLIDATION of SERVICES	CURRENT LEVEL of COOPERATION	Common Administator	ror all units. Parks and Public Works	Parks and Public Works	PW will do all warranty repairs as required	Parks and Public Works	neavy venicles only Parks and Public Works	Parks and Public Works	Heavy venicles only Parks and Public Works	Parks, Water and PW	Parks and Public Works	Parks and Public Works	Parks and Public Works	Parks and Public Works	Parks and Public Works		None		
FENANCE S	WATER	YES	YES	YES	9	YES	YES	YES	ON ON	YES	9	9	9	9	9	YES	YES		
VEHICLE FLEET MAINTENANCE LIKE TASKS	PARKS & REC.	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES		
VEHICLE	PUBLIC WORKS	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES		
Updated 5/12/98	SPECIFIC AREAS FOR COOPERATION	GEMS 2000	VEH SPEC WRITING	VEHICLE PURCHASING	VEHICLE WARRANTY	VEHICLE MAINTENANCE	VEHICLE ROAD SERVICE	WORK AREAS	WORKLOAD SHARE	CUSTOMERS	EQUIPMENT SHARING	PARTS ADMINISTRATION	PARTS PURCHASING	PARTS DISTRIBUTION	CONSUMABLES	FUELING	ADMINISTRATION		

	BUILDING AND FACILITY C	NG AND FACILITY COMMITTEE CONSOLIDATION REPORT	REPORT			
	Parks & Recreation	Public Works	Current Level of		Completion	Value of
Specific Work Task	Responsibility	Responsibility	Cooperation	Recommendation	Status	Consolidation
Elevator maintenance and	Contract administration of	Contract administration of	Contract is coordinated	Consolidate two elevator	COMPLETE	\$2,500
inspection	Park owned facilities	city owned buildings	through Public Works	maintenance contracts into one		
Hardscape and Landscape	Assist Public Works with	Assist Parks and Recreation	Both departments provide	Complete a review of P.W.	Dec. 98	undetermined
maintenance	expertise and resources	with expertise and resources	service for coordinated	facilities that may receive park	-	
	in the area of landscaping	in the area of hardscape	effort when necessary	maintenance, pending resources		
Annual Service Contracts	Maintenance of all Park	Maintenance of all City	Individual departments	Award one contract for each type	COMPLETE	\$12,000
	owned facilities and amenities	owned facilities	administer their contracts	of work to be administered by		
			hvac, plumbing, electrical	using department		
Thermal and moisture	Maintenance of all Park	Maintenance of all City	Individual departments	Shared contracts to maintain	COMPLETE	\$2,500
protection	owned facilities and amenities	owned facilities	specify and administer	consistency and secure lowest bid	·	
			their own contracts	administered by using department		
Benchmarking	Develop and evaluate	Accessing and benchmarking	No current level of	Information and measurements be	Dec. 98	undetermined
	performance measures	with other facility managers	cooperation	shared if similar work is performed		
Quarterly sharing sessions	None	None	No current level of	Begin quarterly sharing sessions	COMPLETE	\$4,000
			coordination			
Building Inspections	Maintenance and evaluation	Maintenance and evaluation	None	Begin to utilize and standardize	Dec. 98	undetermined
and evaluation	of all Park owned facilities	of City owned facilities		all condition and assessment forms		
	and amenities			and develop a comprehensive		
				inventory		
Roofing Assessment	Contract evaluation and	Contract development,	New since last raport	Continue this coordinated effort	COMPLETE	\$4,500
Program	administration of Park owned	evaluation, and administration	both departments are	to decrease the long term costs		
	facilities	on Public Works' properties	fully participating	based on evaluations		
Fountain Maintenance	Maintenance of all Parks and	Maintenance of City Hall	Periodic consultation	Review possibility of Parks	Dec. 98	undetermined
	Recreation fountains	and Barney Allis fountains		assuming the maintenance and		
				operation of City Hall and others		

COUNTION   PARKS & REC.   PUBLIC MONKS   COURTION CONSTITUTION		STREE	REET/BOULEVARD MAINTENANCE	NCE	5/22/98		
PUBLIC WORKS & REC.   PUBLIC WORKS   COURRENT LEVEL OF		S	ONSOLIDATION REPORT				
PARKG & REC.   PUBLIC WORKG   COOPERANT EVELOPY							
Birdges on Bivds, and Parkways.   Birdges on Streets and Roads.   All Birdge Inspections consolidated   Consolidated	ABOW CIBICAGO	PARKS & REC.	PUBLIC WORKS	CURRENT LEVEL OF	RECOMMENDATION	DATE OF	VALUE
Biridges on Bivds, and Parkways, Bridges on Streets and Roads.   All Bridge inspections consolidated	TASKS	RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSIBILITY	COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION		COMP.	
Birdges on Bivds, and Parkways.   Birdges on Streets and Roads.   *All Major Birdge Repair & Construction	Bridge Inspections	* Bridges on Blvds, and Parkways.	Bridges on Streets and Roads.	* All Bridge Inspections consolidated through Public Works.	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	N/A	N/A ·
Bivds, & Parkways and Park Roads & Patkways & Park Areas & Roads & Public Works & Parkways & Park Areas & Streets & Roads & All Testing and Depuge Consolidated in Water Services.    Bivds, & Parkways & Park Roads & Streets & Roads & All Testing & Cheaning Consolidated in Water Services.   Bivds, Parkways & Park Areas & Streets & Roads & All Testing Public Works.	Bridge Repair and Construction	* Bridges on Blvds. and Parkways.	* Bridges on Streets and Roads.	* All Major Bridge Repair & Construction Projects are reviewed, designed & Imple-	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	N/A	ΝΑ
* Bivds. & Parkways  * Bivds. & Parkways  * Bivds. & Parkways and Park Roads  * Bivds. Parkways and Park Roads  * Bivds. Parkways & Park Roads  * Bivds. Parkways & Park Roads  * Streets & Roads  * All Repair & Cleaning Operations being  * Consolidated in Water Services.  * All Repair & Cleaning Operations being  * All Signalization, Pavement Markings & Traffic Signage Consolidated in Public  * Streets & Roads  * Streets & Roads  * All Signalization, Pavement Markings & Traffic Signage Consolidated  * All Signalization, Pavement Markings of through Parks and Recreation.  * Padestrian & Ornamental Lighting on Public Works does not maintain.  * Streets & Roads  * All Street Lighting Consolidated  * All Works does not maintain and Park Areas.  * Streets, Roads & Public Properties.  * All Works and Recreation.  * All Works and Recreation.  * All Works A Parkways and Park Areas.  * Streets, Roads & Public Properties.  * All Works and Recreation.  * All Works A Parkways and Park Areas.  * Streets, Roads & Public Properties.  * All Works and Recreation.  * All Works A Parkways and Park Areas.  * All Works A Parkways an				mented through a coordinating committee consisting of both Depts. Public Works administers most projects by mutual consent.			
* Bivds, & Parkways, Park Roads & * Street & Roads through Public Works.  * Bivds, Parkways, Park Roads & * Street & Roads through Public Works.  * Bivds, Parkways and Park Roads & * Streets & Roads through Public Works.  * Bivds, Parkways and Park Roads & * Streets & Roads & * All Repair & Cleaning Operations being consolidated in Water Services.  * Bivds, Parkways & Park Areas & * Streets & Roads & * All Signalization, Pavement Markings & Traffic Signage Consolidated in Public Works.  ** Bivds, & Parkways & Park Areas & * Streets & Roads & * All Signalization, Pavement Markings & * All Signage Consolidated in Public Works does not maintain & * Streets & Roads & * All Integendent of emergency safety barticates & * Bivds, & Parkways are maintained by similar systems except by agree-  ** Bivds, & Parkways and Park Areas & * Streets & Roads & * All Integendent & * All Integer & * All				* Minor Bridge Repairs Performed through Public Works.			
* Bivds., Parkways, Park Roads * Street & Roads Parking Lots.  * Bivds., Parkways and Park Roads * Streets & Roads Parkways & Parkways and Park Roads * Streets & Roads Parkways & Parkways and Park Areas & Streets & Roads & Parkways and Park Areas & Streets & Roads & Parkways and Park Areas & Streets & Parkways & Parkways and Park Areas & Streets & Parkways & Parkwa	Large Box Culverts	* Blvds. & Parkways	* Streets & Roads	* All large box culvert repairs consolidated through Public Works.	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	N/A	N/A
* Bivds., Parkways and Park Roads. * Streets & Roads consolidated in Water Services.  * Bivds. & Parkways & Park Areas * Streets & Roads through Pale Services * Streets & Roads * * All Signalization, Pavement Markings & Traffic Signage Consolidated in Public Works.  * Bivds. & Parkways & Park Areas * Streets & Roads through Public Works.  * Bivds. & Parkways and Park Areas * Streets & Roads & Public Works does not maintain Bivds. & Parkways are maintained by similar systems except by agree single systems of systems except by agree systems systems except by agree syste	Pavement Resurfacing	* Blvds., Parkways, Park Roads & Parking Lots.	* Street & Roads	* All resurfacing consolidated through Public Works.	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	A/N	N/A
* Bivds. & Parkways  * Streets & Roads  * All Signalization, Pavement Markings & Traffic Signage Consolidated in Public Works.  * Bivds., Parkways & Park Areas  * Streets & Roads  * Bivds. & Parkways & Parkways  * Streets & Roads  * None-  * Bivds. & Parkways are maintained by similar systems except by agree-  ment with private sector. No con-  solidation necessary.  * Bivds., Parkways and Park Areas.  * Streets, Roads & Public Properties-  * All Urban Forestry Services Consolidated  * All Luban Forestry Services Consolidated  * All Reservices Consolidated  * All Reservic	Catch Basins-Cleaning and Repair	* Blvds., Parkways and Park Roads.	* Streets & Roads	* All Repair & Cleaning Operations being consolidated in Water Services.	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	NIA	N/A
rergency * Blvds, Parkways & Park Areas * Streets & Roads * The placement of emergency safety barti- ers, barricades & lights is coordinated through Public Works  * All Street Lighting Consolidated through Public Works does not maintain Blvds. & Parkways are maintained by similar systems except by agree- ment with private sector. No con- solidation necessary.  Services; * Blvds., Parkways and Park Areas. * Streets, Roads & Public Properties- * All Urban Forestry Services Consolidated * All the Services provided by Parks through Parks and Recreation.	Signalization, Pavement Markings & Traffic Signage	* Blvds. & Parkways	* Streets & Roads	* All Signalization, Pavement Markings & Traffic Signage Consolidated in Public Works.	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	N/A	N/A
* Blvds. & Parkways * Streets & Roads * All Street Lightling Consolidated  * Blvds. & Parkways * None-  * Blvds. & Parkways * Public Works does not maintain * Pedestrian & Ornamental Lightling on Public Works does not maintain Blvds. & Parkways are maintained by similar systems except by agree-  * Parks and Recreation.  * Streets, Roads & Public Properties-  * Streets, Roads & Public Properties-  * Streets, Roads & Public Properties-  * All Urban Forestry Services Consolidated All tree services provided by Parks through Parks and Recreation.	Placement of Emergency Safety Barriers	* Blvds., Parkways & Park Areas	* Streets & Roads	The placement of emergency safety barriers, barricades & lights is coordinated through Public Works.	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	N/A	N/A
* Bivds. & Parkways	Street Lighting	* Blvds. & Parkways	* Streets & Roads	* All Street Lighting Consolidated	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	N/A	N/A
* Blvds., Parkways and Park Areas. * Streets, Roads & Public Properties. * All Urban Forestry Services Consolidated All tree services provided by Parks through Parks and Recreation. and Recreation by an areament.	Ornamental & Pedestrian Lighting	* Blvds. & Parkways	* None-Public Works does not maintain similar systems except by agreement with private sector. No consolidation necessary.	Pedestrian & Ornamental Lightling on     Blvds. & Parkways are maintained by     Parks and Recreation.	* No Consolidation necessary at this time.	¥ N	N/A
	Urban Forestry Services; e.g. pruning, removals, & plantings.	* Blvds., Parkways and Park Areas.	* Streets, Roads & Public Properties- All tree services provided by Parks and Recreation by agreement.	* All Urban Forestry Services Consolidated through Parks and Recreation.	* Consolidated Prior to Audit	N/A	N/A

F VALUE	$\vdash$	0		0 2		1	0 2			0 2	_			N/A		17							V/IV	<b>VA</b>	000					7												
DATE OF	COMP.	11/1/97		11/1/97			11/1/97			11/1/07						10/1/97					_				3/1/98					5/1/98	5/1/9	5/1/9	5/1/9	5/1/9	5/1/9	5/1/9	5/1/9	5/1/9	5/1/9	5/1/9	5/1/9	5/1/9
RECOMMENDATION		* Consolidation Completed	paradino indiana	* Consolidation Completed			* Consolidation Completed			* Concelled Completed				* Consolidated Prior to Audit		<ul> <li>Reviewed routes and reconfigured to</li> </ul>	reduce travel time and improve	effeciency for 1997-98.	<ul> <li>Continue annual reivew.</li> </ul>				11 Y 4 7 1 2 1 7 1 7 1 7 1 7 1 7 1 7 1 7 1 7 1	Consolidated Filor to Audit	* Continue annual review of emergen-	Automoneo ellustione as nart of a	concerted effort to make improve-	ments.	Later Carried Library	Consolidation Completed.	Consolidation Compresed.	Consolidation Completed.	Consolidation Completed.	Consolidation Completed.	Consolidation Completed.	Consolidation Completed.	Consolidation Completed.	Consolidation Completed.	Consolidation Completed.	Consolidation Completed.	Consolidation Completed.	Consolidation Completed.
CURRENT LEVEL OF	COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION		All drainage ditch maillenance has been consolidated through Public Works	* Public Works performs all shoulder repairs	П		Public Works performs all guard rail repairs	and maintenance city-wide.		C. T. C.	rubile Wolks Deficiells all paveillelle to	pails oil Divus., rainways, sueers, modes	alid Falvilly Lots as included, vily mide.	* All ice & snow removal operations are	centrally administered through Public	Works.		* Found no areas of duplication.	<ul> <li>Continue to review Ice and Snow operations</li> </ul>	annually as part of on-going efforts to im-	prove efficiency & effectiveness between	departments.		Public Works & Parks and Recreation	work closely together in responding to	any city entergettry requiring an illinear	ate response, e.g. snow storins, ice	SMIIIS, WILL SECTION, INCOME, CEC	* Found no areas of duplication.	I calla llo el cac ci antilicani	Total I of the second of the s	*Street Sweeping services on Boulevards,	* Street Sweeping services on Boulevards, Parkways, and Park streets is being performed	* Street Sweeping services on Boulevards, Parkways, and Park streets is being performed by Public Works.	Street Sweeping services on Boulevards, Parkways, and Park streets is being performed by Public Works.	Street Sweeping services on Boulevards. Parkways, and Park streets is being performed by Public Works.	Street Sweeping services on Boulevards, Parkways, and Park streets is being performed by Public Works.	Street Sweeping services on Boulevards, Parkways, and Park streets is being performed by Public Works.	Street Sweeping services on Boulevards. Parkways, and Park streets is being performed by Public Works.	Street Sweeping services on Boulevards, Parkways, and Park streets is being performed by Public Works.	Street Sweeping services on Boulevards. Parkways, and Park streets is being performed by Public Works.	Street Sweeping services on Boulevards. Parkways, and Park streets is being performed by Public Works.
DI IBI IC WORKS	RESPONSIBILITY		All public rights-or-ways.	# Choose & Doode	eduled basis	by Public Works crews.	* Streets & Roads-	Performed as needed by	Public Works crews.		raikways, oileeis o	Koads.		* Streets & Roads				4	**					- City-Wide					* Major Arterials-High level of ma-		S	S	w	s	σ I	v	v	8	8	9	8	9 5
DABVE 9 BEC	RESPONSIBILITY		* Park Areas	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	Performed as needed by Parks	and Recreation crews.	* Blyds. Parkways & Parks-	arks	and Recreation crews.		- Park Koads			* Blyde Parkways Park Roads		0								* City-Wide	The second secon	the state of the s			* Blvds. & Parkways-		High level of maintenance.	High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.	High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.	High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.	High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.	High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.	High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.  **Downtown Bivds Intense level of	High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.  **Downtown Bivds Intense level of maintenance. Approx. 96 sweepings	High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.  * Downtown Blvds. Intense level of maintenance. Approx. 96 sweepings per year.	High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.  **Downtown Blvds Intense level of maintenance. Approx. 96 sweepings per year.	High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.  * Downtown Blvds Intense level of maintenance. Approx. 96 sweepings per year.	High level of maintenance. Approx. 18 sweepings per year.  **Downtown Bivds Intense level of maintenance. Approx. 96 sweepings per year.
YIGOM OLITOLIG	TASKS		Drainage Ditch Maintenance	T	Maintenance		Guard Rail Renair & Maint	-			Pavement Repair			*   Grown Daniel										ency Response	Efforts				Street Sweeping				•									

Page 2.

¢	?	
•	0	
	o,	
•	₩.	

SPECIFIC WORK	PARKS & REC.	PUBLIC WORKS	CURRENT LEVEL OF	RECOMMENDATION	DATE OF	VALUE
TASKS	RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSIBILITY	COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION		COMP.	
Mowing Turf	* Blvds . & Parkways-Intense level	* Traffic Islands-Moderate level of	* Found no areas of duplication.	* Pursue consolidation of grounds	10/1/98	N/A
	of maintenance. Approximately 26	maintenance. Approximately 7		maintenance operations city-wide		Possible
The second secon	to 28mowings per year.	to 13 mowings per year.		through Parks and Recreation. Inclu-		Savings
			* Formulating plans to consolidate the Ad-	des mowing performed by other city		Through
	* Park Areas-High level of maintenance	* Roadsides-Minimal level of mainte-	ministration of Grounds Maintenance Con-	departments, e.g. Water Services and		Centralized
	Approximately 14 mowings/year.	nance. Approximately 5 mowings	tracts through Parks and Recreation.	Neighborhood & Community Services.		Bidding
		per year.				
			<ul> <li>Working with Law Department on standard-</li> </ul>			
		* Public Works Owned Vacant Lots-	izing contract documents.			
		Moderate level of maintenance.				
		Approximately 9 mowings per year.				
Application of Herbicides	* Blvds. & Parkways-	* Downtown Streets-	* Found no areas of duplication.	* Pursue consolidation of Herbicide	10/1/98	N/A
	Application of selective herbi-	Application of non-selective		Applications through Parks and		
	cides for control of broadleaf	herbicides to control vege-		Recreation.		
	weeds in turf areas. Single	tation in sidewalks, curbs				
	application annually.	and streets.				
		* Rural Roads-				
		Application of non-selective				
		herbicides to eradicate vegetation		Administration of the Control of the		
		around guard rails & signs, & to	AMERICAN TO THE PARTY OF THE PA			
		eradicate noxious weeds.				

PUBLIC WORKS/PARKS AND RECREATION CONSOLIDATION REPORT

VALUE OF 6 CONSOLIDATION	NA								N/A	N/A	N/A			CHALLOWIT				N/A		N/A		NI/A	VA.	NIA																	£330 000 00	340,000,00								Inknoun	i Doni				
RECOMMENDATION	ntified	Coordination should continue.							Consolidation Complete	Consolidation Complete		Roview			responsibilities. Coordination wil	continue mondin joint participation in	ees.	No Duplication	Cont'd Coord, and Joint Review	No Duplication	Vanfades to consolidation	T		No Duplication			Continue Coordination							New professional services contract	forms have been perfected by Law and	are being used by all four operating	departments. In addition, all	opportunities for upcoming projects	are being distributed through the	City's website.	Coordination has increased from joint	T	pariicipation in ULCC and Standards	Committees. Parks is administering tree	trimming function of new P.W. Street Light	Program. Departments will continue to	identify and evaluate specific opportunities	where coordination can improve overall	operation.	has increased from joint		Committees Departments will continue to	identify and evaluate specific covordunities	where coordination and adjusting on the	where coordination can improve overall
COOPERATIONICONSOLIDATION	Each department does planning in its area of responsibility	with unique projects for its respective customers. Each uses	the other in their respective areas of expertise.	Coordination is occurring at monthly park development	months on the modicination in the Tennesteries	meenings and by participation in the transportation and	Development Committee meetings.		All bridges, storm and sanitary sewers are designed and	constructed through a coordinating committee from both	Deots. Pub Wks administers most projects.	Both Depts use outside consultants for most projects	Cost Don't falso and of their aim commentation	במנון ספור ומעפט כמום כן ווופון סאון ופפורטון מומווופט				Parks handles all	Coordinated through Parks	Parks handles all	Each Dept takes care of their own responsibilities	All street lighting consolidated	Darko handloo oli		raiks now participating in OLCC and Sid's Committee		Both departments have been working with Law, Aviation	and Water Services to develop standard General Confract	Provisions that will be used for all City construction contracts	These will be completed by 4-30-97	Bolh deals are narticinating in a contact processing	committee with other controlling described	Contributed with other contracting departments.	Both are participating in a review of contracts with other	departments for the purpose of standardization.						Each denartment is handling its own responsibilities									Presently reviewing for possible consolidation					
PUBLIC WORKS RESPONSIBILITY	By project specially						]			All except interceptors and those on Park land	All except those on Park Land. Blyds and pkwys	Т							All other streets and Public Facilities	None	All other buildings except Aviation and Water						All Public Works Projects						2 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 -		)						All Public Works Projects									All Public Works Projects Property Surveys					
PARKS & RECREATION RESPONSIBILITY	By project specially									Any on Blvds and Parkways or within Park land	Any on Blvds and Parkways or with in Park land	Г	and Park Boade						All Blvds and Parkways and Park Facilities	All Cily owned	buildings	Park Roarls	Ī			• •	All Parks Projects						All Darlas Desirate								All Parks Projects			•						All Parks Projects					
SPECIFIC WORK TASKS	Project Planning									Sanitary Sewers	Storm Sewers	Streets	lean					llies	Landscape	Fountains	Public Buildings					Contract Procedures:	Construction						Drofoonional Comingo								Construction Inspection									Survey					

PUBLIC WORKS/PARKS AND RECREATION CONSOLIDATION REPORT

VALUE OF (	CONSOLIDATION							•	•	• •		•	•			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
RECOMMENDATION		Parks will research, track and forecast	testing needs. P.W. will gather	performance data and evaluate capacity to	nandle additional workload.	Research revealed that P & R spends	less than \$15,000 annually for outside	testing services. This workload will	testing services. This workload will not justify a new position in P.W.	testing services. This workload will not justify a new position in P.W. materials testing, but P & R agrees to	testing services. This workload will not lustify a new position in P.W. materials testing, but P. & Ragrees to give P.W. first right of refusal to	testing services. This workload will not justify a new position in P.W. matchist testing, but P. & R agrees to give P.W. first right of refusal or provide the services confingent on	testing services. This workload will not justify a new position in P.W. materials testing, but P. & R agrees to give P.W. first right of refusal to provide the services confingent on available personnel.	not lustify a new position in P.W. materials testing, but P.&. R agrees to glive P.W. first right of refusal to provide the services confingent on available personnel. No further consideration should			
CURRENT LEVEL OF	COOPERATION/CONSOLIDATION	Presently reviewing for possibility of Public Works	providing service to Parks at less cost	1			-				<b>20 1 2 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3</b>				This activity is performed by each department as an integral had not it is service delivery and in that legard responds to its		
PUBLIC WORKS	RESPONSIBILITY	All Public Works projects except specialties Prese	such as geolech, welding and environmental provice											All Public Works Projects This a			
PARKS & RECREATION	RESPONSIBILITY	All Parks projects by contract	<i>S</i>											All Parks Projects			
SPECIFIC WORK TASKS		Materials Testing												Project Tracking			

4/13/98

### Appendix C

\_\_\_\_\_

Consolidation Status of Selected Parks and Public Works Department Activities

### Consolidation Status of Selected Parks and Public Works Department Activities

Activity	Status in 1995	Status in 2000		
Vehicle Fleet Maintenance				
arts Purchasing	Separate	Citywide contract		
onsumables	Separate	Citywide contract		
ehicle Purchasing	Separate	Citywide contracts.		
<b>G</b>	•	Specialized vehicles		
		separate		
orkload Sharing	None	None		
quipment Sharing	None	None		
ueling	Separate	Parks and PW share		
_	•	a fueling station		
ehicle Specification Writing	Separate	Parks and PW share		
,	•	specifications		
EMS 2000	PW used GEMS	Parks pulled out from		
		GEMS 2000		
ehicle Warranty	Separate	Separate		
ehicle Road Service	Separate	Separate		
ehicle Maintenance	Separate	Separate		
ork Areas	Separate	Separate		
ustomers	Separate	Separate		
arts Administration	•	•		
arts Distribution	•	•		
		•		
Building and Facility Maintenance				
evator Maintenance				
	•	PW contractors		
nnual Service Contracts for HVAC	Separate	Consolidated through		
	•	PW contractors		
nnual service contracts for roofing,	Separate	Consolidated through		
water proofing, asbestos removal	•	PW contractors		
	Separate	Cooperation on a project		
Maintenance	•			
nnual Service Contract for Plumbing	Separate	Separate		
ountain maintenance	Separate	Separate		
Street/Boulevard Maintenance				
reet Lighting	Separate	Consolidated through PW		
rainage Ditch Maintenance	Separate	Consolidated through PW		
oad Shoulder Repair and	Separate	Consolidated through PW		
Maintenance		-		
uard Rail Repair and Maintenance	Separate	Consolidated through PW		
reet Sweeping	Separate	Consolidated through PW		
acement of Emergency Safety	Coordinated	Coordinated through		
arriers		Emergency Management		
mergency Response Efforts	Separate	Coordinated through		
	·	Emergency Management		
oplication of Herbicides	Separate	Separate		
rnamental and Pedestrian Lighting	Separate	Separate		
owing Turf	Separate	Separate		
Building and evator Maintenance  Innual Service Contracts for HVAC  Innual Service contracts for roofing, water proofing, asbestos removal ardscape and Landscape Maintenance  Innual Service Contract for Plumbing buntain maintenance  Innual Service	Separate	Separate Separate Separate  Consolidated through PW contractors Consolidated through PW contractors Consolidated through PW contractors Cooperation on a project by project basis Separate Separate  Consolidated through P Consolidated through Emergency Manageme Coordinated through Emergency Manageme Separate Separate		

Follow-Up Audit: Consolidation of Selected Activities of the Parks and Recreation and Public Works Departments

Activity	Status in 1995	Status in 2000	
Construction and Inspections			
Materials Testing	Separate	Consolidated through PW lab for roadway projects. Water Services does water testing in Brush Creek.	
Construction Inspection Project Tracking Survey	Separate Separate Separate	Separate Separate Separate	
Contract Procedures	Separate	Separate but a standardized guide developed	
Project Planning	Separate	Separate but some projects coordinated	
Project Design	Separate	Separate but some projects coordinated	

### Appendix D

**Director of Parks and Recreation's Response** 



### INTER-DEPARTMENTAL COMMUNICATION

Date:

April 14, 2000

To:

Mark Funkhouser, City Auditor

From:

Terry R. Dopson, Director of Parks, Recreation and Boulevards

Subject:

Response to the revise draft of consolidation audit

This memo is in response to the revised draft of the City Auditor's follow up audit on Parks/Public Works Consolidation.

We agree with the four revised recommendations, and will continue to work with the City Manager's Office and the staff of the Public Works Department on this project.

Terry R. Dopson, Director Parks, Recreation & Boulevards

C: Ed Wolf Rich Noll

### Appendix E Director of Public Works' Response

APR 1 3 2000

CITY AUDITOR'S OFFICE



### **Public Works Department**

**DATE:** April 12, 2000

TO: Mark Funkhouser, City Auditor

FROM: George E. Wolf Jr., ACM / Director of Public Works

SUBJECT: Follow-Up Audit – Public Works and Parks and Recreation Duplication

We have reviewed the revised draft report for the "Follow-Up Audit: Consolidation of Selected Activities of the Parks and Recreation and Public Works Departments" dated 4/7/00.

We appreciate the recognition given both departments for the efforts made to date. As related to your auditors and is apparent from the ARTS reports of the original audit, considerable staff time and effort have been devoted to this effort. We believe significant improvements have occurred with savings or cost avoidance approaching one quarter of a million dollars per year.

With regards to the revised specific recommendations, we are in agreement with the four recommendations.